

# The Reality of University Performance According to the Models of Excellence in Palestinian Universities

Suliman A. El Talla<sup>1</sup>, Ahmed M. A. FarajAllah<sup>2</sup>, Samy S. Abu-Naser<sup>3</sup>, Mazen J. Al Shobaki<sup>4</sup>

<sup>2</sup>Department of Business Administration, Al-Azhar University – Gaza

<sup>1</sup>Department of Business Administration, Al-Aqsa University, Gaza, Palestine.

<sup>3,4</sup>Department of Information Technology, Faculty of Engineering and Information Technology, Al-Azhar University, Gaza, Palestine.

<sup>1</sup>Eltallasuliman@gmail.com, <sup>2</sup>afarajallah@alqsa.edu.ps, <sup>3</sup>abunaser@alazhar.edu.ps, <sup>4</sup>mazen.alshobaki@gmail.com

**Abstract:** The study was designed to identify the reality of applying the leadership standard in the international quality models in Palestinian universities. The study used the analytical descriptive method. The study was conducted on the university leadership in Al-Azhar and Islamic Universities. The study population consisted of 282 individuals. 119 individuals responded, and the questionnaire was used for data collection.

The study has reached a number of results, the most important of which is the existence of a high level of results of university performance in the Palestinian public universities operating in the southern governorate in the following order: performance results for students and beneficiaries, performance outcomes in relation to society and finally: performance results in relation to human resources.

The study presented a number of recommendations, the most important of which is: increasing the interest of universities in the university staff by providing them with job security and increasing their participation in decision making, increasing the interest of the local community through activating the continuing education departments and partnerships with the private sector, increasing the interest of students and beneficiaries by providing an educational environment and appropriate learning and academic programs that meet the needs of the labor market.

**Keywords:** University performance, excellence models, Palestinian universities, Palestine.

## 1. INTRODUCTION

The need to develop higher education has emerged from today's competitive economic conditions and the resulting lack of job stability. One aspect of this development is performance management in higher education institutions. The use of effective methods of evaluating performance in these institutions is reflected positively on activities to serve the objectives of these institutions (Jad Al-Rab, 2010).

Hence, it was necessary to search for modern and contemporary methods that correspond to the size of the changes and developments faced by the institutions based on the strategic objectives of the institution and the need to work on the formulation of a set of key performance indicators that reflect the results and outcomes that must be achieved in the long term: and how to meet the requirements that the institution seeks to translate into a range of aspects that reflect the performance required to achieve.

In terms of investment in the quality of education and its excellence, one of the modern and important trends in higher education, to achieve competitive advantage, and sustainability - at the level of inputs and processes - and ensure the outputs are consistent with the specified standards including the requirements of the competitive labor market, this study was one of the rare studies that aim to answer the following main question: "What is the reality of the university performance according to the models of excellence in the Palestinian public universities operating in

the southern provinces?", and it stems from it the following sub-questions:

**Q1-:** What is the reality of the results of students and beneficiaries in Palestinian public universities operating in the southern governorates?

**Q2-:** What is the reality of the results of human resources in the Palestinian public universities operating in the southern governorates?

**Q3-:** What is the reality of the results of the community in the Palestinian public universities operating in the southern governorates?

## 2. RESEARCH OBJECTIVES

In line with the study's questions, the current study seeks to achieve a set of objectives, namely:

1. Explain the reality of the results of students and beneficiaries in the Palestinian public universities operating in the southern governorates.
2. To identify the level of human resources results in the Palestinian public universities operating in the southern governorates.
3. To reveal the reality of human resources results in the Palestinian public universities operating in the southern governorates.

## 3. RESEARCH IMPORTANCE

1. To provide Palestinian universities with indicators of the reality of university performance.

2. To provide recommendations and proposals documented and derived from the field study to help the senior management of Palestinian universities in the application of the method of excellence in performance.
3. This study may contribute to drawing the attention of researchers to carry out many studies and researches in the modern administrative curricula and apply them to a vital sector, the higher education sector.

#### 4. RESEARCH LIMITS AND SCOPE

1. **Objective limitation:** The study was limited to identifying the reality of university performance in the general Palestinian universities operating in the southern governorates according to the models of excellence.
2. The application of the study was limited to the general Palestinian universities operating in the southern governorates (Islamic University, Al-Azhar University).
3. **Human Limit:** This study focused on the employees of the supervisory centers of the universities under study.

#### 5. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

##### **The concept of outstanding university performance:**

Performance is the outcome of the various activities undertaken by the organization, a reflection of the way in which tangible and intangible resources are invested in the university in order to achieve the desired goals and performance, as Husseini defined it as a holistic activity that reflects either the organization's success, sustainability and adaptability to the environment, They fail based on specific criteria that the organization describes according to their activity requirements, and in the light of long-term goals (Rashid and Al-Zayadi, 2013). It is defined as: the integrated system of the work of the institution in light of its interaction with the elements of its internal and external environment (Al-Douri, 2005).

In order for the university to be successful in its work and adaptable to its environment, its performance must be distinct in comparison to the competing universities. Outstanding performance is no longer an option but an imperative necessity imposed by many conditions and variables surrounding the universities.

The outstanding performance is the uniqueness and positive superiority of performance, practices and services provided, and is an advanced stage of workmanship and efficient performance based on leading management concepts (Buhaji, 2008).

The modern management of institutions - and universities alike - is based on a set of concepts and principles governing their performance, the behavior of their employees, and seeks to achieve excellence by maximizing their capabilities and improving their components by defining a clear vision and mission and comprehensive goals for all elements of their institutional performance.

In this context, there is a need for a set of elements for this excellence in performance. These include the availability of strategic leadership that sets strategies and policies that

define the direction of the university, the existence of organizational systems and structures that define the tasks, responsibilities and powers, the inputs required by the organization to perform its work, Performance, in addition to the performance outputs that distinguish the university from others, and create a competitive advantage.

##### **Criteria for measuring university performance:**

The criteria and indicators of institutional performance are the result of the experiences experienced by the institutions and formulated at standard points to be used in the evaluation process for their performance. Some of these indicators differed according to the environment in which the institution operates. However, these standards are considered as scientific regulations and standards. . The standard is defined as: a comparator and an estimate, which is the necessary standard for a good university education that can be accepted, and is a reference measure that can be used to evaluate university performance (Al-Haj, et al., 2009).

A performance indicator is defined as a set of quantitative and qualitative measures that are used to track performance over time to determine how well they meet agreed performance levels. The test points that monitor progress towards standards are whether we have achieved good performance or not. Are our practices good and distinct, or are they good but not distinct? (Rashid and Al-Zayadi, 2013).

##### **Global Performance Assessment Standards:**

Global quality and excellence models have set their standards to quality standards (standards) and performance performance criteria. In this context, the Malcolm model of the US National Benchmark has set a single benchmark for performance results, the overall performance benchmark, which includes a set of sub-criteria (NIST, 2014):

Results Standard: It gives systematic focus on all outcomes necessary for the stability of educational organizations, student learning, results of operations, results of focus on students and other beneficiaries, results of focus on the workforce, leadership and governance results, general and financial budget and market performance through five sub-criteria :

- Results of student learning and processes.
- Results of focus on beneficiaries.
- Results of focus on the workforce.
- Leadership and governance results.
- Budget, financial, and market results.

While the European Model of Excellence identified four criteria for performance results (EFQM, 2013):

1. Beneficiary results: Distinguished organizations achieve and maintain desired outcomes that meet the needs and expectations of beneficiaries.
2. The results of individuals: Outstanding organizations achieve and maintain the desired results that meet the needs of their individual and their expectations.
3. Community Outcomes: Distinguished organizations achieve and maintain desired outcomes that meet the needs and expectations of stakeholders in society.

4. Overall performance results: Outstanding organizations achieve and maintain the desired results that meet the needs and expectations of their stakeholders.

In this context, and through the study model, which the researchers prepared in the fourth section of this chapter, the study adopted a set of performance performance criteria, which are the most important performance performance criteria found in most models of quality and international excellence (NIST, 2014):

#### **1. Students and Beneficiaries:**

Where it measures distinguished universities and comprehensively achieves outstanding results in its performance while respecting students, beneficiaries and the labor market. This criterion consists of the following two criteria:

##### **A. Measuring the perception of students and other beneficiaries in the university, such as:**

- Employees are flexible and responsive to their needs.
  - Providing the university with a quality educational process.
  - The University offers educational programs that are suitable for the students' aspirations and the job market.
  - The focus of study plans is on developing students' practical skills.
  - The university uses a variety of methods to evaluate students' learning outcomes (exams, research, labs .....).
- ##### **B. Performance Indicators - Internal university standards to monitor student satisfaction, eg:**
- Providing the university with suitable services for students (clinic, playgrounds, cafeteria ...).
  - There is mutual trust between students and university employees.
  - The university dealt with student complaints seriously and finding quick solutions to them.
  - Providing advanced and advanced courses.
  - Providing excellent educational services.

#### **2. Standard results of human resources:**

Where distinguished universities measure and comprehensively achieve outstanding results in the performance of their employees of academics and administrators, and this criterion consists of the following two criteria:

##### **A. Measuring the perception of employees at the university, such as:**

- The University provides opportunities for career development and learning for employees.
- University staff feel secure in the job.
- Relations between employees are positive and humane.
- The University has a fair and transparent human resources systems.
- Employees are involved in decision-making processes.
- The University appreciates the achievements of the staff.

##### **B. Performance indicators - internal university standards for monitoring, understanding, predicting and improving staff performance, eg:**

- Appreciation of employees' efforts and participation in task forces, training and motivation programs.
- Employees have high satisfaction rates at university.
- Employees have convenient services that make them comfortable.
- Employees' productivity is constantly increasing.

#### **3. Standard Community Outcomes:**

Where distinguished universities measure and comprehensively achieve outstanding results in their performance of the local, regional and international community. This criterion consists of the following two criteria:

##### **A. Measuring the society's perception of the university, for example:**

- The University provides public facilities, research and service centers that serve the community well.
- The University holds its role in community responsibility.
- University work on improving and preserving the community environment.
- The university is transparent with the local community.

##### **B. Performance indicators - internal university standards to monitor community satisfaction, eg:**

- The media adequately cover the activities of the University.
- The University receives medals and awards for its role in the service of the community.
- The University is building appropriate partnerships with community institutions.
- The University provides community-specific resources appropriately.

#### **4. Standard Overall Performance Results:**

It measures distinguished universities and comprehensively achieves outstanding performance results while respecting key elements of its strategy and plans. This standard consists of the following sub-criteria:

##### **A. Results of financial performance, such as:**

- The University's commitment to spending according to the budget line items.
- Rationalize the University for its Expenses.
- Achieving the University's financial surplus resulting from its operations.
- University collection of debts owed by beneficiaries.

##### **B. Non-financial performance results, for example:**

- Increasing number of students enrolled in university.
- Higher opportunities for university graduates in employment for other universities.
- Distinguish the results of internal and external self-assessment.
- The University has introduced new programs constantly adapted to the labor market.

##### **C. Overall performance indicators - internal university metrics for overall performance monitoring, eg:**

- Improvement in university performance.
- Exploitation of buildings and facilities effectively.

- Link the university with good relations with suppliers and partners.
- Access to information and knowledge in the form, time and quantity appropriate.

### **Measuring and evaluating university performance within the framework of international quality standards**

If attention is focused in the twentieth century on productivity, the 21st century is a century of interest in quality and excellence. The interest in quality has begun in the productive sector, and the interest in quality gradually shifted to the services sector, including the education sector.

The universities are one of the important building blocks in society because they prepare the generations for the future, to advance the nation and lead it towards development and excellence, and to advance it in the era of rapid change, the era of globalization and knowledge. Higher education is the strategic asset that provides communities with the human resources they need for development. Overall.

Over the past years, governments have sought to make a significant shift in the application of quality concepts in universities through the establishment of national bodies for quality assurance and accreditation. These bodies have also sought to send specialists to Europe and Quality standards and accreditation, and ended with the issuance of a set of standards for the application of Arab universities, and emerged a number of concepts including the overall quality, quality assurance and accreditation, ISO education, excellence award, and other concepts with a view to establish the principles of Mother.

### **Management Excellence Concept:**

The organizations in various fields, including universities in our era - the era of globalization and knowledge - to implement TQM to achieve excellence in performance, and to achieve a competitive advantage by completing the process of accreditation of local quality bodies to obtain international certificates of excellence, International.

The definitions of excellence management vary according to the researchers' views. One researcher defined them as "the systematic use of TQM principles and tools that improve performance based on various principles (Jad Al-Rab, 2013):

- Focus on customers.
- Achieving value in various administrative practices and actions.
- Operations and Projects Management.

(Jad Al-Rab, 2013) as "the strategic leadership features of sophisticated business organizations, which focus on managing the organizational elements, assets and resources that the organization outperforms other organizations to achieve a better competitive edge than its competitors.

The management of excellence is "those activities that make the organization distinct and superior in its performance from the rest of the competitors by employing the

capabilities and resources available to be effective and distinguished in a way that makes them superior and unique, and this is reflected in how to deal with the client both internal and external, and how to perform its activities and operations, and to develop their own administrative and regulatory policies and strategies" (Abdullah, 2007).

As defined by the European Organization for Quality Management as "the outstanding practice in the management of the Organization and the achievement of results that satisfy the various parties from customers, employees, shareholders, etc. The brilliant practice goes to a range of factors such as leadership that formulate and direct policies, strategies, human and financial resources, Information and others" (EFQM, 2013).

Al-Salmi (2002) recognized excellence as "a state of managerial innovation and organizational excellence that achieves extraordinary levels of performance and execution of operations ... resulting in achievements that outweigh what competitors achieve and are satisfied by customers and all stakeholders in the organization" Al-Salmi, 2002).

The same writer identified the concept of excellence in two central dimensions of modern management (Al-Salmi, 2002):

**The first dimension:** All the decisions and decisions adopted by the administration, and the systems and activities they adopt, must be characterized by excellence, that is, the perfect quality that leaves no room for error or deviation, and creates the real opportunities to achieve the correct work from the first time.

**Second dimension:** Achieving unprecedented results that the organization excels over its competitors and even itself (the previous results) with the logic of learning.

"The ability to harmonize and coordinate the organization's components and operate them in an integrated and coherent manner to achieve the highest levels of efficiency and thus reach the output level that fulfills the wishes and expectations of stakeholders associated with the organization (Oakland, 2001).

Through the previous definitions and agreement with the purposes of this study, researchers can define the concept of excellence in higher education as "the university through the leadership of a conscious strategy to exploit all its financial and human resources to achieve outstanding quality in its operations and outputs through continuous improvement to achieve the satisfaction of the beneficiaries of the community and students, And to achieve a competitive advantage for others."

According to the American experience of educational institutions, the concepts of excellence were defined according to the Malcolm model as follows (Al-Ayadi, 2009):

**Table 1:** The concepts of excellence and their translation regarding higher education according to Malcolm Baldrige model

Excellence Model Definitions	Translation of definitions regarding higher education
<b>Determine Results</b>	
Excellence achieves results that satisfy all stakeholders in the organization	Clearly focus on the understanding, needs, aspirations and values of students and other clients, taking into account their contributions and the contributions of other stakeholder groups
<b>Customer orientation</b>	
Excellence is creating sustainable value for customers	Predict, balance and meet the current and future needs of students, employees and others by developing a balanced set of indicators and appropriate targets, monitoring and benchmarking and taking appropriate action to a comprehensive set of such information
<b>Stability of purpose and leadership</b>	
Excellence is an inspirational vision and leadership along with constant purpose	Excellence is an inspirational vision and leadership alongside a constant purpose that clearly demonstrates an inspirational vision and leadership that is transparent and open with consistency and unity of purpose (goal) in which all those in the organization
<b>Management processes and facts</b>	
Excellence is the management of the organization across a coherent group and related to each of the systems, processes and facts	Understand and manage all activities systematically across a coherent set of systems, processes, and decisions based on sound and documented information
<b>Integration and development of individuals</b>	
Excellence is to maximize employee contributions through their development and interaction	Develop, share and interact with staff and maximize their contributions in a positive and encouraging way involving their values, environment of trust, openness and empowerment
<b>Partnership development</b>	
Excellence is the development and maintenance of value added for partnerships	Develop mutually beneficial and mutually beneficial relationships in order to gain value for partners and support the achievement of strategic and operational objectives
<b>Responsibility of the social establishment</b>	
Excellence is beyond the minimum legal framework where the institution works and strives to understand and meet the expectations of stakeholders in society	Understanding, appreciation and positive consideration of how the institution interacts with the community and its impact on it and on a broader practical and ethical level
<b>Continuity in learning, creativity and improvement</b>	
Excellence is to identify the current status and make a difference using learning to create an opportunity for innovation and improvement	Encourage, manage, and share learning, experiences, and changes by using creativity, innovation, and empowerment for continuous improvements of consistently adding value
<b>Lean</b>	
Speed of movement, flexibility, ability to change rapidly	
<b>Going forward</b>	
Knowledge of long and short term factors affecting the organization	

Hence, the researchers find that excellence is the path of the universities to improve their performance and achieve a competitive advantage that distinguishes them from the rest of the universities and allows them to optimize their resources to meet the needs of their students and the society to provide high quality outputs that meet the global requirements in the era of globalization and allow graduates of these universities Complete their studies or work outside the local market.

**Quality and Excellence Models:**

With the great global changes that have occurred and continued to this day, which exceeded the capabilities of organizations to adapt to reality, and led to its inability to

continue the rate of performance, and to activate the role of the so-called powers of the four (4C's) and the Consumer and Competition, Change, and Complexity on the one hand, as well as the information and communication revolution, on the other hand, to rethink the concepts and principles on which the organizations were founded, and to search for new approaches and methods to achieve precedence and competition. The most recent trends and systems in their management, notably management of the overall quality of, which comes at the forefront of management ideas that fit this age and competitive in it.

The literature and studies confirmed that the concepts of TQM were the basis of the movement of the search for

outstanding performance, through its importance in improving profitability and competitive position as well as responding to the expectations of customers and improve productivity, which reflects the importance of this portal in achieving outstanding performance of the organization, at all levels (Yousef, 2010)

Quality concepts have evolved and moved through stages, beginning with the examination phase, then the statistical monitoring of the quality, then the quality assurance, and then the total quality management, which brings the organizations to excellence.

## 6. LITERATURE REVIEW

- Study of (Rashid and Al-Zayadi, 2013) aimed at knowing the role of leadership in achieving outstanding university performance through a survey of the views of (100) university leaders in a sample of universities of the Middle Euphrates universities (Qadisiyah, Karbala, Babylon, Kufa) the two questionnaires are a key tool for data collection. The study found that there is support and commitment to creative activities. There is an average interest in risk tolerance. There are clear efforts in the field of pre-emptivity by identifying the needs of future students and turning them into new opportunities. On the employees, and there is a close relationship between the components of the leading orientation and outstanding university performance, and there is a significant effect of the leading trend on the university performance excellence.
- Study of (Rashid and Al-Zayadi, 2014) aimed at presenting a theoretical study on the variables of the study, as well as an analytical framework for the views of 34 university leaders in a sample of the faculties of Qadissiya University. The independent variable included elements of intellectual capital , Structural capital, and relational capital), while the dimensions of outstanding performance (outcomes of student learning and process, results of community focus, results of employee focus, leadership and governance results, budget results, and financial and market outcomes) . The study found the following results: There is a clear focus on human resources, and on the activation of knowledge capital, there is a lack of partnership relations, weak response to the wishes and expectations of students and other stakeholders, and there is a degree of commitment in the performance results in relation to leadership, There is a great interest in the results of the budget and financial results, and there is a close link between the components of intellectual capital and outstanding university performance, and there is a statistical impact of intellectual capital and its components on outstanding university performance.
- Study of (Smulowitz, 2015) aimed at identifying the potential impact of performance indicators on the perceived outcome of organizational change to understand differences in stakeholder views. The data

were collected by interviewing 32 participants from four departments to support educational services and a group of senior Leadership University. The results indicated that the two implementers failed to assess employee satisfaction, contribute to the implementation process, and performance indicators can be the main vision for successful change efforts.

- Study of (Adel, 2009) aimed at identifying the most important factors that lead to higher performance of Egyptian higher education institutions, achieving distinct results, identifying strengths and areas that need improvement to achieve sustainable excellence, and using questionnaire to collect data. The study found that the Egyptian higher education institutions have substantial potential (leadership, personnel, strategy, resources, partnership, and processes) that directly affect their results (employee satisfaction, user satisfaction, impact on society, and performance outcomes). Will improve the overall excellence of Egyptian higher education institutions.
- Study of (Al-Jabaree, 2009), which aims to identify the effectiveness of the management of excellence and its contribution to the development of the performance of institutions of higher education in the West Bank, by examining the reality of the application of excellence management and its relationship to the development of institutional performance. The study used descriptive analytical method, the data are distributed through the heads of the quality and development units and their deputies in higher education institutions in the West Bank. The results showed that there is a moderate level of excellence in higher education institutions in the West Bank (leadership, strategies, human resource management, relationships and resources, student focus, scientific research, and operations management). There is an average level of performance indicators, Satisfaction and results of students, employee satisfaction and impact on society), the existence of a correlation between the possibilities with the achievement of the development of performance of institutions of higher education through the results of business, and the existence of disparities in the application of standards of excellence between institutions of higher education.
- Study of (Shirvani et al., 2011), which aimed at evaluating the performance of medical science universities based on the European model of excellence. This study was conducted between 2012 and 2011. The study was applied to a sample of 13 universities. The educational work of the nine standards of the model by a radar methodology through the managers who received the training. The results showed that all universities scored higher than 200/1000, while one university obtained 350/1000, and that the differences between the quality criteria and the performance results were between 19.4 and 102.5. The main performance results

were higher and the results of the society the results indicated that there are no significant differences between the results and the possibilities and the nine criteria of the model according to the university variable. The study recommended that the Iranian medical universities plan and implement improvement projects for all standards, especially the results criteria.

- Study of (Al-Dajani, 2011), which aims to identify the role of strategic planning in the quality of institutional performance and the development of standards and indicators to measure the institutional performance in Palestinian universities. The researchers used the analytical descriptive approach and the constructive developmental approach. The study community consisted of deans, managers, Islamic University and Al-Aqsa University. The number of (100) members has been met (91) members (91%) of the society of the study. The study found that there were significant differences in the level of performance due to the university variable in favor of the Islamic University. The institutional performance rates in the Palestinian universities were high. The quality of performance in the dimensions of philosophy, mission, goals, governance and administration, institutional scope, institutional resources and services High, and showed a significant relationship between strategic planning and quality of institutional performance.
- Study of (Abu Saada, 2013), which aimed to identify the application of leadership standard in higher education institutions according to the European model of excellence. The case of the university college of applied sciences was studied as a practical case. The study adopted the analytical descriptive method through a questionnaire on a sample of (64) of administrative staff and academics at the College. The study found that leadership performance at the university college was 75.9%, the leadership interaction with students and other beneficiaries was 79.11%, followed by the vision and message development criteria with the participation of the relevant authorities (77.15%). the standard efforts of leaders in the development and application of the administrative system (75.86%), followed by the leaders' efforts to increase competition and encourage change (73.92%), and finally the standard of supporting and encouraging staff, and promoting the culture of excellence (73.80%).
- Study of (Moradzadeh, 2015), which aimed to identify the feasibility of applying the European model of excellence in higher education institutions. The descriptive method was used in the study. The data were collected from 22 educational zones through a random sample of (345), Middle, managers and staff, in all educational units. The results showed that the institutions of higher education under study applied well the elements of the European model of excellence, and that three main elements influencing the implementation

of the criteria of the European model of excellence are the stakeholders, leadership and structure. The results also showed the need to develop a model that takes into account the local culture and other environmental factors and that standards of enterprise enable the results of beneficiaries, employee outcomes, community outcomes, and key performance outcomes.

#### **Comment on previous studies**

In reviewing previous studies, researchers found the following:

- Studies related to the evaluation of university performance in accordance with the quality standards contained in the international excellence models, but without addressing a particular model, are the studies of (Rashid and Jalab, 2007), Al-Jabaree (2009) These studies did not specify the mechanism for selecting these criteria. The current study chose the criteria based on the analysis of the content of the global models and the use of the Delphi method to determine the most common criteria, especially in the field of higher education.
- The studies that linked university performance with one of the criteria of quality and excellence, which dealt with knowledge management as an intangible asset (Al-Dajani, 2011), and linked performance with strategic planning, Abu Saada (2013), which linked leadership with institutional excellence.
- Studies related to the evaluation of university performance in accordance with the accreditation criteria of the local accreditation bodies are the studies of: (Rashid and Jalab, 2007) (Al-Samadi, 2009), the current study focuses on quality standards and global excellence and not on accreditation standards from local accreditation bodies.
- The studies that linked the results of the outstanding performance to other variables are the studies of Rashid and Al-Zayadi (2013), which linked the pioneering approach with the results of the distinguished university performance, Smulowitz (2015), which linked the management of change to the quality of performance and excellence, Al-Zayadi, 2014), which linked intellectual capital to the achievement of outstanding university performance.

#### **7. METHODOLOGY AND PROCEDURES:**

**The study method:** The study followed the analytical descriptive method, in which it tries to describe the phenomenon of the subject of the study, analyze its data, and explain the relationship between its components, and the views that are raised around them, and the processes involved, and effects.

**The study population:** The study population is composed of all employees of the supervising positions in the public universities operating in Gaza Strip (Islamic University, Al-Azhar University), which are (282) employees and employees.

**Sample of the study:** The sample of the study was selected using the method of class randomization as one of the statistical methods used to be representative of the study society according to the rules of scientific research in the selection of samples. The sample size was (135) individuals by 47.9% of the size of the society, where the recovered and valid questionnaires for statistical analysis was (119) by (88.1%). A sample of 29 individuals was selected from outside the study sample. Statistical analysis was conducted to verify the validity and stability of the questionnaire.

**Study tool:** To achieve the objective of the study, the questionnaire was used as a data collection tool, which was developed and developed according to the criteria set by the researchers and to arrive at the questionnaire in its final form. It emerged in its final form, which consists of four areas): The field of the "results of students and beneficiaries", which consists of (9) paragraph, the field of "human resources results" consists of (8) paragraphs, and the field of "the results of society" consists of (8) paragraphs.

**Correction of the study tool:** The five-point Five-Dimensional Likert Scale was used to determine the importance of each paragraph of the questionnaire to measure the respondents' responses to the questionnaire sections according to the following table:

**Table 2:** the degrees of the five-dimensional Likert scale

Category	Absolutely Agree	Agree	To Some Extent	Not Agree	Not Quite OK
Class	5	4	3	2	1

In addition, a numerical scale was used to give the mean of the arithmetical mean using the ordinal scale of significance. The study adopted the criterion mentioned by Abdel-Fattah (2008) to judge the trend when using the five-dimensional Likert scale.

**8. STATISTICAL PROCESSES:**

The study used the Statistical Package of Social Sciences (SPSS) to perform the necessary analysis of the questionnaire data. The following statistical methods and tests were used: percentages, frequencies and arithmetic mean, Pearson Correlation Coefficient to measure the degree of correlation: This test examines the relationship between two variables, it was used to calculate the internal consistency and structural integrity of the questionnaire, the Cronbach's Alpha test to determine the persistence of the questionnaire, T test in the case of one T-Test: to determine whether the average response was neutral (60% ), increased or decreased. It has been used to confirm the mean significance of each paragraph of the questionnaire.

**The validity of the study tool:** The validity of the study instrument was verified using the internal consistency method to measure the correlation strength between the scores of each area of the field with the total score of the field to which it belongs. The results showed that the first field, "student and beneficiary results" (0.866 - 0.831). The second field, "human resources results", was directly

correlated with all the paragraphs that measured it. The correlation coefficients ranged from (0.564 to 0.883). The third field of "the results of society" Directly linked to all the paragraphs it measure, the inspired correlation coefficients between (0.718 - 0.925), all of which are statistically significant at the abstract level ( $0.01 = \alpha$ ), and indicate that they are internally consistent with the area that measured by, a key measure in

**Stability of the study instrument:** The stability of the study questionnaire was verified by the Cronbach's Alpha Coefficient coefficient. The following table shows that the value of the Cronbach alpha coefficient was high for all domains ranging from 0.897 to 0.921. This means that the questionnaire consistency is high.

**Table 3:** Determination of the stability of the questionnaire using Cronbach's Alpha coefficient

No.	Dimension	No. Of Items	Cronbach's Alpha
1.	Results of students and beneficiaries as a whole	9	0.907
2.	Results of human resources as a whole	8	0.897
3.	The results of society as a whole	8	0.921

**9. ANSWER THE STUDY QUESTIONS:**

In order to answer the study question, the researchers used several statistical methods, such as: arithmetical averages, standard deviations, as well as the use of a single sample test for each of the domains. The answer of the paragraph is positive in the sense that the sample agrees with its content if the calculated t value is greater than the tabular t value of 1.99 or the probability value is less than 0.05 and the arithmetic mean of the paragraph is greater than (3) Do not agree with their content if the calculated t value is less than the t-value of the t-table, which is 1.99, the probability value is greater than 0.05, the arithmetic mean of the paragraph is smaller than (3) Probability is greater than (0.05).

**Answer the first question, which states:** "What is the reality of the results of students and beneficiaries in the Palestinian public universities operating in the southern provinces?"

In reviewing the responses of the sample of the study on the reality of the results of students and beneficiaries, Table 4 indicates that the mathematical averages for all areas of the "measuring the perception of students and other beneficiaries in the university" ranged from (3.79 to 4.31). In general, this field has an average arithmetic of (4.00). The second area, "Performance Indicators - Internal Standards of the University to Monitor Students' Satisfaction" ranged from (3.76 to 3.95) and in general, the field obtained an average of (3.84). In general, the field of students' and beneficiaries' outcomes as a whole has obtained an average of (3.94), which is a large degree. This indicates that university leaders believe that the results of human resources are good and appropriate to achieve the goals of the university and the



employees, and in line with the approach of quality and excellence.

**Table 4:** Analysis of the paragraphs and areas of the results of students and beneficiaries

No.	Item / Dimension	Mean	S. D.	T – Test	Sig.	Rank
1.	Staff deal with students with flexibility and speed in meeting their needs	4.31	1.65	3.88	0.00	1
2.	The University provides a high quality educational process	3.88	0.67	14.31	0.00	3
3.	The University offers educational programs that are suitable for students' aspirations and the job market	3.79	0.72	11.91	0.00	5
4.	Study plans focus on developing students' practical skills	3.86	0.69	13.50	0.00	4
5.	The University uses a variety of methods to evaluate student learning outcomes such as exams, research, and practical labs	4.18	0.69	18.62	0.00	2
Measuring the perception of students and other beneficiaries at the university		4.00	0.83	13.15	0.00	-
1.	There is a steady increase in the satisfaction of students and beneficiaries of the services provided by the University	3.82	0.66	13.40	0.00	3
2.	Mutual trust is built between the university on the one hand and students and stakeholders on the other	3.84	0.66	13.81	0.00	2
3.	The complaints of students and other beneficiaries are dealt with seriously and appropriate solutions are found	3.95	0.83	12.45	0.00	1
4.	Students and stakeholders are involved in the design of processes and programs.	3.76	3.80	2.19	0.00	4
Performance Indicators - Internal Standards for the University to monitor student satisfaction		3.84	1.10	8.36	0.00	-
Results of students and beneficiaries as a whole		3.94	0.79	12.90	0.00	-

**Answer to the second question, which states: "What is the reality of the results of human resources in the Palestinian public universities operating in the southern governorates?"**

The results of the study sample on the reality of human resources results, Table 5 shows that the mean averages for all the items of the "measuring employee perception" ranged between (3.62 - 3.95). In general, the field obtained an average of (3.74), and the second area, "Performance Indicators - Internal Standards for the University to Monitor, Understand and Improve the Performance of Employees", the averages for the paragraphs ranged between (3.39 - 3.54). In general, the field obtained an arithmetical mean (3.49). Overall, the field of human resources results as a whole has obtained an average of (3.61), which is a middle grade. This indicates that university employees feel that the results achieved are not in the desired form, which corresponds to their aspirations and with the quality and excellence approach.

The results show that there is a difference in the vision of the university leaders to the results of the employees and the opinion of the employees themselves, where the leaders of the university that the results achieved good, while the

employees believe that the results are moderate, and can be better.

The findings also agreed with the study of (Rashid and Al-Zayadi, 2014), (Adel, 2009), (Moradzadeh, 2015) the availability of high human resources results, also agreed with the study of (Al-Jabaree, 2009), with the view of employees, which indicated a moderate degree of human power output. The results differed with (Smulowitz, 2015), with a low score in human resources results.

In the opinion of the researchers: The difference in the view of university leaders with the view of employees, is due to the employees believe that they can give to their universities more, if the good organizational climate, and the appropriate focus on them by the leaders of the universities, and this brings us to the need to The university leaders should focus more on the human resources and staff of the university, and develop good performance indicators to monitor, understand and improve university performance, in addition to the need to measure the awareness of university staff in the required manner, through their participation in the decision-making process and appreciation of their achievements and other things that create a climate of positive action.

**Table 5:** Analysis of paragraphs and areas of human resources results

No.	Item / Dimension	Mean	S. D.	T – Test	Sig.	Rank
1.	The University provides opportunities for career development and learning for employees	3.62	0.83	8.14	0.00	4
2.	University staff feel secure in the job	3.71	0.82	9.45	0.00	2
3.	Relations between employees are positive and humane	3.95	0.81	12.77	0.00	1

No.	Item / Dimension	Mean	S. D.	T – Test	Sig.	Rank
4.	The University has a fair and transparent human resources systems	3.66	0.90	8.09	0.00	3
Measuring the perception of employees at the university		3.74	0.64	12.66	0.00	-
1.	Employees' efforts are appreciated through their participation in the task forces and training programs	3.54	0.93	6.32	0.00	2
2.	Employees have high satisfaction rates at university	3.39	0.86	5.03	0.00	4
3.	They have good services that make them comfortable at work	3.54	0.84	6.98	0.00	1
4.	Employees' productivity is constantly increasing	3.49	0.87	6.10	0.00	3
Performance Indicators - Internal metrics for the university to monitor, understand and improve employee performance		3.49	0.74	7.21	0.00	-
Results of human resources as a whole		3.61	0.65	10.37	0.00	-

**Answer the third question, which states: "What is the reality of the results of the community in the Palestinian public universities operating in the southern provinces?"**

A review of the responses of the sample of the study on the reality of the results of the society, Table 6 indicates that the mathematical averages for all the items of the "measuring societal perception of the university" ranged from (3.76 to 3.93). In general, the field obtained an arithmetic mean (3.91) the second area, "Performance Indicators - Internal Standards of the University to Monitor Community Satisfaction," ranged from (3.64 to 3.98), and generally had a mean (3.86). In general, the field of human resources results as a whole obtained an average of (3.86), which is a large degree

This shows that university leaders believe that the results of society are good and appropriate to achieve the goals of the university and society, and in line with the approach of quality and excellence.

The results were consistent with the studies of (Rashid and Al-Zayadi, 2014), (Adel, 2009), with a high level of community outcomes.

The results differed from the studies of (Al-Jabaree, 2009) and (Shirvani et al: 2011) in the degree of community outcomes.

The results of the community are high as a result of the services provided by the universities through community service and continuing education on the one hand and research centers in these universities on the other. For example, Al-Azhar University has a number of research centers serving such as the Water and Environment Center, the Center for Continuing Education and Community Service, the Food Analysis Center, the Drug Analysis and Research Center, the National Center for Academic Development and the Legal Clinic. The Islamic University has a number of community service centers, The Center for Heritage Development, the Center for Research and Projects, the Center for Excellence and e-Learning, the Center for Educational Technology. There are also many at Al-Aqsa University of the community service centers, including: the Geomagnetic Research Center, the Space and Astronomy Research Center, the Development and Community Service Center, and the Deanship of Continuing Education. Despite the rise in the results of the community, but the importance of community and social responsibility must be enhanced by improving the services offered through these centers, in addition to studying the needs of the community and opening service centers to meet these needs.

**Table 6:** Analysis of the paragraphs and areas of the results of society

No.	Item / Dimension	Mean	S. D.	T – Test	Sig.	Rank
1.	The University assumes its role in community responsibility	3.87	0.74	12.84	0.00	2
2.	The University provides public facilities, research and service centers that serve the community well	3.83	0.77	11.73	0.00	3
3.	The University works to improve and preserve the community environment	3.76	0.77	10.88	0.00	4
4.	The university deals transparently with the local community	3.93	0.71	14.33	0.00	1
Measuring community perception about the university		3.91	0.88	11.27	0.00	-
1.	The media adequately cover the activities of the University	3.98	0.78	13.73	0.00	1
2.	The University receives medals and awards for its role in the service of the community	3.96	0.75	13.89	0.00	2
3.	The University is building appropriate partnerships with community institutions	3.89	0.71	13.67	0.00	3
4.	The University provides community-specific resources appropriately	3.64	0.85	8.08	0.00	4

No.	Item / Dimension	Mean	S. D.	T – Test	Sig.	Rank
	Performance Indicators - Internal Standards of the University to monitor community satisfaction	3.86	0.63	14.94	0.00	-
	The results of society as a whole	3.86	0.59	15.78	0.00	-

The following table shows that the field of students' and beneficiaries' results came to a large extent, with an arithmetic mean (3.94). The standard deviation indicates that the respondents' responses were not significantly different and were close to their arithmetic mean, where the standard deviation was 0.79. The average of the results of the society as a whole came to a great extent, where the mean of the arithmetic mean and the standard deviation indicated that the respondents' response was not significantly different and was close to the arithmetic mean, where the standard deviation (0.59) was ranked second, That the results of forces (3.61). The standard deviation indicates that the respondents' responses were not significantly different and were close to their arithmetic mean with a standard deviation of 0.65. In general and in general, the university performance as a whole obtained an average of (3.81) which is a large degree. This indicates that the results of the university performance in the universities under study are good and consistent with the approach of quality and excellence, and the researchers believe that the standards of the results of university performance have been high as a result of the universities of

the effort across the different quality standards, but need to be continuously improve access to the results of outstanding university performance, and the criteria that need special attention is the results of human resources where it ranked last, and universities should be interested in strengthening and supporting other performance standards, TQM not only focus on results, but must focus on all by focusing essentially on quality standards that are outstanding performance mappings, this is what (Rashid and Jalab, 2007) recommend to move from the emphasis on inputs to the focus on processes and outputs together, and to focus attention on comprehensive educational and academic qualification for all elements Educational process.

The results were consistent with the studies of: (Rashid and Al-Zayadi, 2013), (Rashid, Al-Zayadi, 2014), (Al-Dajani, 2011), (Moradzadeh, 2015) with a good degree of university performance results.

The results differed with (Rashid and Jalab, 2007), which indicated a medium degree of university performance results, and (Shirvani et al., 2011), which indicated a low degree of university performance.

**Table 7:** Analysis of the areas of the questionnaire as a whole

No.	Dimension	Mean	S. D.	T – Test	Sig.	Rank
1.	Results of students and beneficiaries as a whole	3.94	0.79	12.90	0.00	1
2.	Results of human resources as a whole	3.61	0.65	10.37	0.00	3
3.	The results of society as a whole	3.86	0.59	15.78	0.00	2
	Results of university performance as a whole	3.81	0.55	19.95	0.00	-

**10. RESULTS**

The study reached a number of results:

- That there is a high level of results of university performance in the Palestinian public universities operating in the southern provinces.
- That there is a high level of performance results for students and beneficiaries with a relative weight of 78.8%.
- That there is a high level of performance results in relation to the community with a relative weight of 77.2%.
- That there is a high level of performance results in relation to manpower with a relative weight of 72.2%.

**11. RECOMMENDATIONS**

Based on the above results, the study recommended:

- Increase the interest of university staff by providing them with job security and increasing their participation in decision making

- Increase the interest of the local community by activating the continuing education departments and partnerships with the private sector.
- Increase the interest of students and beneficiaries by providing an appropriate educational learning environment and providing academic programs that meet the needs of the labor market.

**REFERENCES**

[1]Abdel-Fattah, Ezz (2008). Introduction to Descriptive and Inductive Statistics using SPSS, Al-Khwarizm Scientific Library, Egypt.

[2]Abu Naser, S. S., Al Shobaki, M., & Ammar, T. M. (2017). Impact of Communication and Information on the Internal Control Environment in Palestinian Universities. International Journal of Hybrid Information Technology, 10(11), 41-60.

[3]Al Hila, A. A., & Al Shobaki, M. J. (2016). The Role Of Servant Leadership In Achieving Excellence Performance In Technical Colleges-Provinces Of Gaza Strip. International Journal of Management Research and Business Strategy, 6(1), 69-91.

- [4]Al Shobaki, M. J., Abu-Naser, S. S., Amuna, Y. M. A., & El Talla, S. A. (2018). The Extent to Which Technical Colleges Are Committed To Applying Lean Management. *International Journal of Engineering and Information Systems (IJEAIS)*, 2(1), 23-42.
- [5]Ammar, T. M., Al Shobaki, M. J., & Naser, S. S. A. (2017). The Efficiency Extent Of The Internal Control Environment In The Palestinian Higher Educational Institutions In Gaza Strip. *International Journal of Digital Publication Technology*, 1(2), 107-126.
- [6]Amuna, Y. M. A., Al Shobaki, M. J., Naser, S. S. A., & El Talla, S. A. (2017). The Reality of Electronic Human Resources Management in Palestinian Universities-Gaza Strip. *International Journal of Engineering and Information Systems (IJEAIS)*, 1(3), 37-57.
- [7]Arqawi, S. M., Al Hila, A. A., Abu-Naser, S. S., & Al Shobaki, M. J. (2018). The Degree of Employee Awareness of the Reality of Excellence in Performance at the Technical University of Palestine (Kadoorei). *International Journal of Academic Management Science Research (IJAMSR)*, 2(9), 27-40.
- [8]Abdullah, Kallash (2007). Recent trends in administrative thought, *Journal of Human Sciences*, fifth year, number 35.
- [9]Al Hila, A. A., Al Shobaki, M. J., Abu-Naser, S. S., & Amuna, Y. M. A. (2017). Proposed Model for Learning Organization as an Entry to Organizational Excellence from the Standpoint of Teaching Staff in Palestinian Higher Educational Institutions in Gaza Strip. *International Journal of Education and Learning*, 6(1).
- [10]Al Shobaki, M. J., Abu-Naser, S. S., Abu Amuna, Y. M., & El Talla, S. A. (2018). The Entrepreneurial Creativity Reality among Palestinian Universities Students. *International Journal of Academic Management Science Research (IJAMSR)*, 2(3), 1-13.
- [11]Amuna, Y. M. A., Al Shobaki, M. J., & Naser, S. S. A. (2017). Strategic Environmental Scanning: an Approach for Crises Management. *International Journal of Information Technology and Electrical Engineering*, 6(3), 28-34.
- [12]Arqawi, S. M., Al Hila, A. A., Abu-Naser, S. S., & Al Shobaki, M. J. (2018). Degree of Organizational Loyalty among Palestinian Universities Staff-Case Study on Palestine Technical University-(Kadoorei). *International Journal of Academic Multidisciplinary Research (IJAMR)*, 2(9), 1-10.
- [13]El Talla, S. A., Abu Naser, S. S., Abu Amuna, Y. M., & Al Shobaki, M. J. (2017). The Creative Environment and Its Relationship to the Lean Management of Technical Colleges Operating in Gaza Strip. Paper presented at the Second Scientific Conference on Sustainability and enhancing the creative environment of the technical sector Palestine Technical College - Deir Al Balah 6-7 December 2017.
- [14]FarajAllah, A. M., El Talla, S. A., Abu-Naser, S. S., & Al Shobaki, M. J. (2018). The Impact of the Leadership Standard in International Quality Models on Improving University Performance through the Intermediate Role of the Strategy Standard. *International Journal of Engineering and Information Systems (IJEAIS)*, 2(9), 21-32.
- [15]Salama, A. A. M., Abu Amuna, Y. M., Al Shobaki, M. J., & Abu-Naser, S. S. (2018). The Role of Administrative Procedures and Regulations in Enhancing the Performance of The Educational Institutions-The Islamic University in Gaza is A Model. *International Journal of Academic Multidisciplinary Research (IJAMR)*, 2(2), 14-27.
- [16]Abu Saada, Ismail (2013). Applying Leadership Criterion of EFQM Excellence Model In Higher Education Institutions UCAS as a Case Study, Master thesis, Islamic university- Gaza.
- [17]Amuna, Y. M. A., Al Shobaki, M. J., Naser, S. S. A., & Badwan, J. J. (2017). Understanding Critical Variables for Customer Relationship Management in Higher Education Institution from Employees Perspective. *International Journal of Information Technology and Electrical Engineering*, 6(1), 10-16.
- [18]Madi, S. A., El Talla, S. A., Abu-Naser, S. S., & Al Shobaki, M. J. (2018). The Organizational Structure and its Impact on the Pattern of Leadership in Palestinian Universities. *International Journal of Academic Management Science Research (IJAMSR)*, 2(6), 1-25.
- [19]Arqawi, S. M., Al Hila, A. A., Abu-Naser, S. S., & Al Shobaki, M. J. (2018). Interactive Justice as an Approach to Enhance Organizational Loyalty among Faculty Staff At Palestine Technical University-(Kadoorei). *International Journal of Academic Information Systems Research (IJASIR)*, 2(9), 17-28.
- [20]Abu-Naser, S. S., Al Shobaki, M. J., Abu Amuna, Y. M., & El Talla, S. A. (2018). The Reality of the Effectiveness of Electronic Marketing in Technical Colleges in Palestine. *International Journal of Academic Information Systems Research (IJASIR)*, 2(2), 19-36.
- [21]Al Shobaki, M. J., Abu-Naser, S. S., Abu Amuna, Y. M., & El Talla, S. A. (2018). Support Extent Provided by Universities Senior Management in Assisting the Transition to e-Management. *International Journal of Academic Management Science Research (IJAMSR)*, 2(5), 1-26.
- [22]Al-Hila, A. A., Alshaer, I. M. A., Al Shobaki, M., & Abu Naser, S. S. (2017). The Impact of the Governance of Private Universities in Building Partnership with NGOs Operating in Gaza Strip. *International Journal of Engineering and Information Systems (IJEAIS)*, 1(9), 11-30.
- [23]El Talla, S. A., Abu-Naser, S. S., Al Shobaki, M. J., & Abu Amuna, Y. M. (2018). The Reality of Achieving

- Sustainability in Technical Colleges Operating in the Gaza Strip. *International Journal of Academic Management Science Research (IJAMSR)*, 2(2), 16-30.
- [24] Adel, Reham (2009). Achieving Egyptian higher education institutions' excellence through the application of the EFQM model: an investigative study, *International Journal of Business Excellence* 01/2009; 2(2).
- [25] Al hila, A. A., Al Shobaki, M. J., Abu Amuna, Y. M., & Abu Naser, S. S. (2017). Organizational Excellence in Palestinian Universities of Gaza Strip. *International Journal of Information Technology and Electrical Engineering*, 6(4), 20-30.
- [26] Al Shobaki, M. J., Abu-Naser, S. S., El Talla, S. A., & Abu Amuna, Y. M. (2018). Performance Reality of Administrative Staff in Palestinian Universities. *International Journal of Academic Information Systems Research (IJASIR)*, 2(4), 1-17.
- [27] AlFerjany, A. A. M., Salama, A. A., Amuna, Y. M. A., Al Shobaki, M. J., & Abu-Naser, S. S. (2018). The Relationship between Correcting Deviations in Measuring Performance and Achieving the Objectives of Control-The Islamic University as a Model. *International Journal of Engineering and Information Systems (IJEAIS)*, 2(1), 74-89.
- [28] El Talla, S. A., Abu-Naser, S. S., Al Shobaki, M. J., & Amuna, Y. M. A. (2018). The Application of the Principles of the Creative Environment in the Technical Colleges in Palestine. *International Journal of Engineering and Information Systems (IJEAIS)*, 2(1), 211-229.
- [29] Al-Ayadi, Hatem Ali (2009). Training course on the model of the European Foundation for Quality Management for Excellence in Higher Education, within the project of re-evaluation and re-engineering of administrative processes, quality unit, Islamic University, translation from the University of Halam Sheffield - UK.
- [30] Al Hila, A. A., Alshaer, I. M. A., Al Shobaki, M. J., & Abu-Naser, S. S. (2018). University Governance as an Input to Strengthen Partnership with Local Community Organizations-A Comparative Study between Public and Private Universities. *International Journal of Academic Multidisciplinary Research (IJAMR)*, 2(8), 35-61.
- [31] Al Shobaki, M. J., Abu-Naser, S. S., Abu Amuna, Y. M., & El Talla, S. A. (2018). The Level of Organizational Climate Prevailing In Palestinian Universities from the Perspective of Administrative Staff. *International Journal of Academic Management Science Research (IJAMSR)*, 2(5), 33-58.
- [32] El Talla, S. A., Al Shobaki, M. J., Abu-Naser, S. S., & Abu Amuna, Y. M. (2018). Organizational Structure and its Relation to the Prevailing Pattern of Communication in Palestinian Universities. *International Journal of Engineering and Information Systems (IJEAIS)*, 2(5), 22-43.
- [33] Al Shobaki, M. J., Abu-Naser, S. S., & Ammar, T. M. (2018). The Relationship Reality between the Components of Internal Control and Administrative Transparency in the Palestinian Universities. *International Journal of Academic Information Systems Research (IJASIR)*, 2(3), 1-18.
- [34] Naser, S. S. A., Al Shobaki, M. J., Amuna, Y. M. A., & El Talla, S. A. (2017). The Reality of Electronic Human Resources Management in Palestinian Universities from the Perspective of the Staff in IT Centers. *International Journal of Engineering and Information Systems (IJEAIS)*, 1(2), 74-96.
- [35] Al-Dajani, Iyad Ali (2011). The role of strategic planning in the quality of institutional performance, descriptive descriptive study in Palestinian regular universities, PhD thesis, Damascus University, Syria.
- [36] Al-Douri, Zakaria (2005). *Strategic Management Concepts, Processes and Case Studies*, Dar Al-Yazuri Scientific Publishing House: Jordan.
- [37] Al-Hila, A. A., Alhelou, E., Al Shobaki, M., & Abu Naser, S. S. (2017). The Impact of Applying the Dimensions of IT Governance in Improving e-training-Case Study of the Ministry of Telecommunications and Information Technology in Gaza Governorates. *International Journal of Engineering and Information Systems (IJEAIS)*, 1(7), 194-219.
- [38] FarajAllah, A. M., El Talla, S. A., Abu Naser, S. S., & Al Shobaki, M. J. (2018). Participation of Administrative Staff in Decision-Making and Their Relation to the Nature of Work in Universities. *International Journal of Academic Multidisciplinary Research (IJAMR)*, 2(7), 13-34.
- [39] Al Shobaki, M. J., Abu-Naser, S. S., Amuna, Y. M. A., & El Talla, S. A. (2018). The Availability of Smart Organization Dimensions in Technical Colleges in Palestine. *International Journal of Engineering and Information Systems (IJEAIS)*, 2(1), 49-64.
- [40] Al-Haj, Faisal, et al. (2009). *Quality Indicators and Quantitative Indicators for Quality Assurance and Accreditation for Arab Universities Members of the Union, Union of Arab Universities, Secretariat: Cairo.*
- [41] FarajAllah, A. M., El Talla, S. A., Abu-Naser, S. S., & Al Shobaki, M. J. (2018). The Nature of Work and Its Relation to the Type of Communication among Employees in Palestinian Universities-A Comparative Study between Al-Azhar and Al-Aqsa Universities. *International Journal of Academic Multidisciplinary Research (IJAMR)*, 2(6), 10-29.
- [42] El Talla, S. A., FarajAllah, A. M., Abu-Naser, S. S., & Al Shobaki, M. J. (2018). The Reality of the Overall Performance Level in the Palestinian Universities. *International Journal of Academic Multidisciplinary Research (IJAMR)*, 2(9), 21-29.

- [43]Al Shobaki, M. J., & Naser, S. S. A. (2016). The Dimensions Of Organizational Excellence In The Palestinian Higher Education Institutions From The Perspective Of The Students. *Global Journal of Multidisciplinary Studies*, 5(11), 66-100.
- [44]Hila, A. A. A., Shobaki, M. J. A., & Naser, S. S. A. (2017). The Effect of Academic Freedoms in Enhancing the Social Responsibility of Palestinian University Staff in the Gaza Governorates. *International Journal of Engineering and Information Systems (IJEAIS)*, 1(5), 22-35.
- [45]Naser, S. S. A., & Al Shobaki, M. J. (2017). Organizational Excellence and the Extent of Its Clarity in the Palestinian Universities from the Perspective of Academic Staff. *International Journal of Information Technology and Electrical Engineering*, 6(2), 47-59.
- [46]Al-Jabaree, Taghreed Eid (2009). Role of Excellence in the Performance of Higher Education Institutions in the West Bank "Master Thesis, Hebron University, Palestine.
- [47]Al-Salmi, Ali (2002). Department of Excellence: Models and Techniques of Management in the Age of Knowledge, New Management Library, Cairo.
- [48]Al Shobaki, M. J., Abu-Naser, S. S., Amuna, Y. M. A., & El Talla, S. A. (2018). The Level of Promotion of Entrepreneurship in Technical Colleges in Palestine. *International Journal of Engineering and Information Systems (IJEAIS)*, 2(1), 168-189.
- [49]Al-Samadi, Hisham (2009). The degree of application of comprehensive quality standards in Jordanian higher education institutions from the point of view of heads of departments in the Ministry of Higher Education, *Iraqi Journal of Economic Sciences*, seventh year, number nineteen.
- [50]Baldrige, National Quality Program, (2008). Criteria for performance excellence. Gaithersburg, MD: National Institute for Standards and Technology.
- [51]Buhaji, Mohammed Jassim (2008). Criteria for the Bahrain Center for Excellence Program, Bahrain Center for Excellence, Kingdom of Bahrain.
- [52]EFQM (2013). Overview of the EFQM Excellence model.
- [53]Jad Al-Rab, Sayed (2010). Management of Universities and Institutions of Higher Education, Strategies and Methods of Improvement, First Edition, Academy Library, Cairo.
- [54]Jad Al-Rab, Sayed (2013). Management of Creativity and Competitive Excellence, First Edition, Academy Library, Cairo.
- [55]Moradzadeh, V. (2015). foundation for quality management (EFQM) model feasibility Europe (EFQM) in education institutions, Lorestan province, Iran, the online journal of quality in higher education-, volume2, issue 1 , January 2015.
- [56]NIST (2014), 2013–2014 Baldrige Education Criteria for Performance Excellence, National institute of standard and technology, USA.
- [57]Oakland, John (2001) Total organizational excellence, Butterworth Heinemann, USA.
- [58]Rashid, Salih and Al-Zayadi, Sabah (2013). the role of leadership in achieving outstanding university performance: Analytical study of the views of university leaders in a sample of universities of the Middle Euphrates Universities, *Qadisiyah Journal of Administrative and Economic Sciences*, Volume 15, No. 2 2013, 233.
- [59]Rashid, Salih, and Jalab, Ihsan (2007). the outstanding university performance according to the standards of Malcolm Baldrige: a case study in the Faculty of Management and Economics / University of Qadisiyah, *Journal of Qadisiya University for Administrative and Economic Sciences*, Volume 9, Number 3, pp.
- [60]Shirvani, S.D, et al (2011). Self-Assessment of Iran Universities of Medical Sciences Based on European Foundation for Quality Management (EFQM) and Iran Excellence Model, *World Applied Sciences Journal*, 15 (10): 1391-1397, 2011, ISSN 1818-4952.
- [61]Smulowitz, S. (2015). Evidence for the performance prism in higher education. *Measuring Business Excellence*, 19(1), 70-80.
- [62]Al Shobaki, M. J., Abu-Naser, S. S., Salama, A. A., AlFerjany, A. A. M., & Amuna, Y. M. A. (2018). The Role of Measuring and Evaluating Performance in Achieving Control Objectives-Case Study of" Islamic University". *International Journal of Engineering and Information Systems (IJEAIS)*, 2(1), 106-118.
- [63]Yousef, Boumedienne (2010). Total Quality Management and Excellence Performance, *Journal of Boumerdes University, Algeria*, pp. 27-37.
- [64]Abu Sultan, Y. S., Al Shobaki, M. J., Abu-Naser, S. S., & El Talla, S. A. (2018). Effect of the Dominant Pattern of Leadership on the Nature of the Work of Administrative Staff at Al-Aqsa University. *International Journal of Academic Information Systems Research (IJASIR)*, 2(7), 8-29.
- [65]Al Shobaki, M. J., Amuna, Y. M. A., & Naser, S. S. A. (2017). Strategic and Operational Planning As Approach for Crises Management Field Study on UNRWA. *International Journal of Information Technology and Electrical Engineering*, 5(6), 43-47.
- [66]Ahmad, H. R., Abu-Naser, S. S., El Talla, S. A., & Al Shobaki, M. J. (2018). Information Technology Role in Determining Communication Style Prevalent Among Al-Azhar University Administrative Staff. *International Journal of Information Technology and Electrical Engineering*, 7(4), 21-43.
- [67]Ahmed, A. A., Abu-Naser, S. S., El Talla, S. A., & Al Shobaki, M. J. (2018). The Impact of Information Technology Used on the Nature of Administrators Work at Al-Azhar University in Gaza. *International*

- Journal of Academic Information Systems Research (IJASIR), 2(6), 1-20.
- [68] Al Shobaki, M. J., & Naser, S. S. A. (2017). The Role of the Practice of Excellence Strategies in Education to Achieve Sustainable Competitive Advantage to Institutions of Higher Education-Faculty of Engineering and Information Technology at Al-Azhar University in Gaza a Model. *International Journal of Digital Publication Technology*, 1(2), 135-157.
- [69] Almasri, A., El Talla, S. A., Abu-Naser, S. S., & Al Shobaki, M. J. (2018). The Organizational Structure and its Role in Applying the Information Technology Used In the Palestinian Universities-Comparative Study between Al-Azhar and the Islamic Universities. *International Journal of Academic and Applied Research (IJAAR)*, 2(6), 1-22.
- [70] Naser, S. S. A., Al-Shobaki, M. J., & Amuna, Y. M. A. (2016). Knowledge Management Maturity in Universities and its Impact on Performance Excellence "Comparative study". *Journal of Scientific and Engineering Research*, 3(4), 4-14.
- [71] Al Shobaki, M. J., Naser, S. S. A., & Ammar, T. M. (2017). The Degree of Administrative Transparency in the Palestinian Higher Educational Institutions. *International Journal of Engineering and Information Systems (IJEAIS)*, 1(2), 15-32.
- [72] Alshaer, I. M. A., Al-Hila, A. A., Al Shobaki, M., & Abu Naser, S. S. (2017). Governance of Public Universities and Their Role in Promoting Partnership with Non-Governmental Institutions. *International Journal of Engineering and Information Systems (IJEAIS)*, 1(9), 214-238.
- [73] El Talla, S. A., Al Shobaki, M. J., Abu-Naser, S. S., & Amuna, Y. M. A. (2018). The Nature of the Organizational Structure in the Palestinian Governmental Universities-Al-Aqsa University as A Model. *International Journal of Academic Multidisciplinary Research (IJAMR)*, 2(5), 15-31.
- [74] FarajAllah, A. M., El Talla, S. A., Abu-Naser, S. S., & Al Shobaki, M. J. (2018). The Reality of Adopting the Strategic Orientation in the Palestinian Industrial Companies. *International Journal of Academic Management Science Research (IJAMSR)*, 2(9), 50-60.
- [75] Naser, S. S. A., Al Shobaki, M. J., & Amuna, Y. M. A. (2016). KM Factors Affecting High Performance in Intermediate Colleges and its Impact on High Performance-Comparative Study. *Computational Research Progress in Applied Science & Engineering*, 2(4), 158-167.
- [76] Al Shobaki, M. J., Naser, S. S. A., Amuna, Y. M. A., & El Talla, S. A. (2017). Impact of Electronic Human Resources Management on the Development of Electronic Educational Services in the Universities. *International Journal of Engineering and Information Systems*, 1(1), 1-19.
- [77] Arqawi, S. M., Al Hila, A. A., Abu-Naser, S. S., & Al Shobaki, M. J. (2018). Obstacles to the Application of Knowledge Management from the Point of View of the Employees at the Technical University of Palestine (Kadoorei). *International Journal of Academic Information Systems Research (IJASIR)*, 2(9), 1-16.
- [78] Badwan, J. J., Al Shobaki, M. J., Naser, S. S. A., & Amuna, Y. M. A. (2017). Adopting technology for customer relationship management in higher educational institutions. *International Journal of Engineering and Information Systems (IJEAIS)*, 1(1), 20-28.
- [79] El Talla, S. A., FarajAllah, A. M., Abu-Naser, S. S., & Al Shobaki, M. J. (2018). The Reality of Applying Leadership Standard in Palestinian Universities According to the International Quality Models. *International Journal of Academic Management Science Research (IJAMSR)*, 2(9), 73-82.
- [80] El Talla, S. A., FarajAllah, A. M., Abu-Naser, S. S., & Al Shobaki, M. J. (2018). The Reality of Applying the Policy and Strategy Standard in the Palestinian Universities According to the International Quality Models. *International Journal of Engineering and Information Systems (IJEAIS)*, 2(9), 1-9.
- [81] Madi, S. A., El Talla, S. A., Abu-Naser, S. S., & Al Shobaki, M. J. (2018). The dominant pattern of leadership and Its Relation to the Extent of Participation of Administrative Staff in Decision-Making in Palestinian Universities. *International Journal of Academic Management Science Research (IJAMSR)*, 2(7), 20-43.
- [82] Al Shobaki, M. J., Naser, S. S. A., Amuna, Y. M. A., & Al Hila, A. A. (2017). Learning Organizations and Their Role in Achieving Organizational Excellence in the Palestinian Universities. *International Journal of Digital Publication Technology*, 1(2), 40-85.
- [83] Naser, S. S. A., Al Shobaki, M. J., Amuna, Y. M. A., & Al Hila, A. A. (2017). Trends of Palestinian Higher Educational Institutions in Gaza Strip as Learning Organizations. *International Journal of Digital Publication Technology*, 1(1), 1-42.
- [84] Salama, A. A., Al Shobaki, M., Abu-Naser, S. S., AlFerjany, A. A. M., & Abu Amuna, Y. M. (2018). The Relationship between Performance Standards and Achieving the Objectives of Supervision at the Islamic University in Gaza. *International Journal of Engineering and Information Systems (IJEAIS)*, 1(10), 89-101.
- [85] Shamia, M. J., Al Shobaki, M. J., Abu-Naser, S. S., & Amuna, Y. M. A. (2018). Using the Asian Knowledge Model "APO" as a Determinant for Performance Excellence in Universities-Empirical Study at Al-Azhar University-Gaza. *International Journal of Information Technology and Electrical Engineering*, 7(1), 1-19.
- [86] Sultan, Y. S. A., Al Shobaki, M. J., Abu-Naser, S. S., & El Talla, S. A. (2018). The Style of Leadership and Its
-

- Role in Determining the Pattern of Administrative Communication in Universities-Islamic University of Gaza as a Model. International Journal of Academic Management Science Research (IJAMSR), 2(6), 26-42.
- [87]Naser, S. S. A., Shobaki, M. J. A., & Amuna, Y. M. A. (2016). Measuring knowledge management maturity at HEI to enhance performance-an empirical study at Al-Azhar University in Palestine. International Journal of Commerce and Management Research, 2(5), 55-62.
- [88]Zaqout, I., Abu-Naser, S. S., El Talla, S. A., & Al Shobaki, M. J. (2018). Information Technology used and it's Impact on the Participation of Administrative Staff in Decision-Making in Palestinian Universities. International Journal of Academic Multidisciplinary Research (IJAMR), 2(8), 7-26.
- [89]<http://www.alaqsa.edu.ps>
- [90]<http://www.alazhar.edu.ps>
- [91]<http://www.efqm.org>
- [92]<http://www.iugaza.edu.ps>