

Monitoring and Evaluation of Universal Education for Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in Sindh

Abdul Hafeez

Education and Social Department

Shaheed Zulfqir Ali Bhutto Institute of Science & Technology

Karachi, Pakistan

rajputahafeez@gmail.com

Abstract: *The purpose of this case study is evaluate the performance of Education & Literacy Department Government of Sindh parallel to International and Regional Development Partners to ascertain the efforts mobilize dynamic roles and responsibilities for public good and intergenerational sustainable well-being in the Province of Sindh. This qualitative research analyzed the interventions utilized to conduct the study that provide evidence for advocacy, for national policy development about the prediction of national targets and standers of universal education. Parallel to this it will monitor and evaluate development partner's impacts, outcomes and progress in the relationship that the management, money, time and equipment invested are appropriate and optimal in terms of achieving outputs and outcomes according to the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) agenda 2030. The study will be help full in the requirement of methodological identification of important context, factors and leverage points that commonly lead to successful SD implementation and achievement of universal education standers for Educational leadership of the Province. Case study methodology is employed that maintains very deep connections to the core values and intentions of study, aims to find out the complexities of the study about to explore the performance of the government to ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all. Sindh is the second largest province in Pakistan and the most urbanized with relatively high rates of unemployment and poverty. One of its most prominent and challenging characteristics is the extent of demographic variations across districts in terms of socio-economic status and educational attainment. A significant percentage of the child population remains uneducated with only the provision of poor quality education and inadequate school infrastructure and resource to support their learning. Schooling of girls is marginalized and as such they are more likely to be out of school consistently across all districts of the province. In the means of implementation of the SDGs in the province, the Government yet not defines the strategies and outcomes of MDGs. Various programs of Sindh Government are looking for funds to build and upgrade education system that provide safe and non-violent, effective learning environment for all. Whereas most of the funds released from annual provincial budget and other donors organizations are useless or non-productive.*

Keywords: Monitoring; Evaluation; Sustainable Development Goals; Universal Education and Development Partners.

1. INTRODUCTION

Education has long been a concern of the nation, so for that there are so many important international declarations. The International Commission on education for the 21st defines education is a major source of human development and ensures harmonious manner, (UNESCO, 1996). According to the Universal Declaration of Human Rights Article 26, everyone has right to free education at the fundamental stage. It should strengthen the human rights and fundamental freedom, (Mckeown, 2017). The UN Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) include a list of noble ambitions: eradicate hunger and poverty, education, gender equality, improve maternal health and reduce child mortality, disease reduction and control (AIDS, malaria, etc), environmental sustainability, and global partnership for development. Other equally important ambitions that are embedded in MDG include availability of and access to: clean water, information technology, and basic energy, (Ofei Manu, 2013). Poverty, armed conflict and other emergencies keep many, many kids around the world out of school. In fact in developing regions, kids from the poorest households

are four times more likely out of school than those of the richest households. Since 2000, there has been enormous progress on the goal to provide primary education to all children worldwide. Now the world leaders want to build on the many successes of the past 15 years, the new setoff goals, the Sustainable Development Goals, SDGs (UNDP, Mckeown 2017). However, the emerging challenges in the world address environmental and financial stability requires close concentration at the educational role in the environmental and development challenges in the post 2015 agenda, (Costanza et al, 2013). After the development of the World Conservation Strategy, each country was expected to develop its own National Conservation Strategy (NCS). Pakistan was among the first few countries to start this process. One of the main recommendations of the NCS was for each province to develop a Provincial Conservation Strategy. Decades of poor governance have left the education sector in a state of crisis. The factors responsible include lack of access to educational facilities (some 3 500 schools have been closed due to the unavailability of teachers or funds); utter poverty that prevents families from bearing the costs of education; unsatisfactory quality of

education arising from absent or poorly trained teachers; dearth of school supplies and inadequate infrastructure (shelter less schools, 1-2 room schools, schools without drinking water and sanitation facilities); lack of accountability of school management to communities and service users; weak monitoring and evaluation of performance; and the virtual absence of private sector involvement in rural areas (only 5 percent of primary students are enrolled in private schools), (Sindh Strategy for Sustainable Development Goals, SSSDGs). The 18th Amendment to Pakistan's Constitution, approved in 2010, abolished the Federal Ministry of Education and transferred complete authority to the provinces in matters of education with the proviso that education would be free and compulsory for all children between the ages of 5 and 16. A significant percentage of the child population remains uneducated with only the provision of poor quality education and inadequate school infrastructure and resource to support their learning. Schooling of girls is marginalized and as such they are more likely to be out of school consistently across all districts. The SESP tackles this inequity in the provision of and participation in education as the most important cross-cutting theme in the sector, and the organizing principle around which policies and programs will be implemented over the next five-year period. It addresses both access to education and quality of learning outcomes through the prism of equity, Sindh Education Sector Plan, SESP, 2014). According to the UNESCO, by 2030 ensure that all girls and boys have access to quality preprimary and primary education. This list of key aspects of quality education illustrates the importance of local and provincial /national educational systems in implementing SDGs. The vision of the recently adopted 2030 agenda for sustainable development is ambitious and transformational. The basic principle of the 2030 agenda that no one will be left behind will require significant level of data disaggregation. In order to successfully measure progress and ensure no one is left behind, the availability of quality, accessible, timely and reliable data is essential.

1.1 PROBLEM STATEMENT

Pakistan made no improvement in Net Primary Enrolment Rate (5-9 Years) in 2012-13 that remained 57 per cent, same as last year while the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) require 100 per cent primary enrollment by 2015, Economic Survey (2014). The Annual Growth Rate (AGR) of public schools enrollment was 1.28% while the population increasing with the rate of 2.66%, this shows that the government has not even been able to retain the annual population growth in Sindh, Reform Support Unit (RSU). Despite the fact that since the year 2005 government is incentivizing girl student of primary and preprimary but still the enrolment has not shown an increasing trend as compare to the universal education targets. There is poor incentives and capacity for systematic and strategic, effective implementation, besides minimal monitoring and accountability of service delivery agents for implementation

integrity and performance; system capture by insiders and other special interest groups that prefer the status quo. These trends appear immune to accountability mechanisms to achieve universal education targets sated in National Education Policy (NEP 2009) and Sindh Education Sector Plan, (SESP 2014). This is further exacerbated by the fact that the state allocations for schooling facilities for boys outnumber that for girls at both the primary and secondary levels. Poor infrastructure and inadequate teaching facilities add to the plethora of problems that are limiting progress in the field of education in Sindh. The issue of quality is considered to be of greater value than quantity. What is the point of establishing thousands of schools if they cannot even teach a child how to read or write? Schools do not have to operate within the chardiwari of cement buildings, as long as what is being taught is progressive and inspiring (Sindh Strategy for Sustainable Development).

1.2 OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

- The objectives of this study to monitor and evaluate performance of Sindh government about to achieve targets of SDGs, for universal equitable and quality education. More than this, it also depend on the government progress are according to exceptions of the endeavor.
- Although the monitoring and evaluation are usually linked and more immediate and continuous process meant to keep things on track and insures that the right inputs are included for successful implementation to ensure that the girls and boys complete free, equitable and quality primary and secondary education leading to relevant and effective learning outcomes.
- The study will provide evidence for advocacy, for national policy development about the prediction of national targets and standers of universal education. Parallel to this it will monitor and evaluate development partners' impacts, outcomes and progress in the relationship that the management, money, time and equipment invested are appropriate and optimal in terms of achieving outputs and outcomes according to the United Nation agenda 2030.

1.3 RESEARCH QUESTION

- Do current strategies and programs sated by government of Sindh ensure inclusive and equitable quality education in the Province?
- Do the challenge of the Sustainable Development Goals and Education for All is to provide affordable, sustainable quality basic education for all children under all circumstances learning spaces offered in province of Sindh?

- Does Sindh government developed sufficient policies and mechanism of their implementations and enforcement to achieve universal education by 2030?

2. BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY

The promotion of universal literacy as a basic human right, since 1940 United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) is its priority. This commitment has taken into account the historical development of literacy and evidence concerning strategies for success (Graff, 1987). Education has long been a concern of the nation, so for that there are so many important international declarations. The International Commission on education for the 21st defines education is a major source of human development and ensures harmonious manner, (UNESCO, 1996). According to the Universal Declaration of Human Rights Article 26, everyone has right to free education at the fundamental stage. It should strengthen the human rights and fundamental freedom, (McKeown, 2017). The Convention on the Rights of Child (CRC), explains 18 years national education may not be excluded based on race, sex, disability, economic status, (McKeown, 2017). The most urgent priority is to ensure access to, and improve the quality of, education for girls and women, and to remove every obstacle that hampers their active participation. All gender stereotyping in education should be eliminated, (World Declaration Education for All 1990). The United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development (UNDESD) 2005-2014 is another effort in support of education in a long history of such programs. Furthermore, education is a priority of the Government of Pakistan. This report is authored as part of the global exercise to monitor progress of nations towards achievement of goals and targets of Dakar Framework of Action. This framework was signed by international community on April 28, 2000, in Dakar Senegal. Along with other 164 countries, Pakistan also signed Dakar Framework of Action and committed to achieving 6 Education-For-All (EFA) Goals by 2015

2.1 AGENDA OF UNITED NATIONS FOR 2030

After Earth Summit 1997 the first conference held in New York at the head quarter of United Nation Organization in 2000 in this conference world leaders joined to gather to adapt Millennium Development Goal (MDGs) and the declaration was approved by General Assembly, C.Vasconcelos, J Costa & J Torra (2016). In order to continue this successful work of MDGs targets and objectives, world leaders from 150 countries were invited around the world in September 2015 in the head quarter of UNO. In this conference the new agenda were sated with the name of SDGs for fifteen years from 2015 to 2030, emphasizing 17 objectives and 169 goals to meet collectively and individually C.Vasconcelos, J Costa & J Torra (2016).

2.2 UNIVERSAL EDUCATION AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS (SDGs)

The progress in 15 years of MDGs has been counted better in progress, hunger has been cut in half, more kids are going to school and fever are dying in more than 170 countries and territories. Now these countries want to build on the many successes of the past 15 years and go further. The new set of goals, the Sustainable Development Goals (MDGs), aims to end poverty, insure inclusive and equitable quality and promote life learning opportunities for all, (United Nation Development Program, UNDP). According to SDGs, by 2030, ensure that all girls and boys complete free, equitable and quality primary and secondary education leading to relevant and effective learning outcomes.

2.3 EDUCATION FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT (ESD)

UNDESD (United Nation Development of Education for Sustainable Development) is a step in the history United Nations to promote Sustainable Development and Education. No doubt education and learning are more tied with sustainability. Whereas, the ESD program inherent the idea of implementing programs that are locally relevant and culturally appropriate.

2.4 SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS – THE LINKAGES

Of the 17 goals, SDG 4 is dedicated to Education. With 7 targets and 3 means of implementation, succinct evidence based policy papers such as “Sustainable Development Begins with Education”⁶ acknowledge that all 16 SDGs are linked to education-SDG 4, and that without a comprehensive cross-sector effort, which begins with education, the SDGs cannot be realized. For instance, education can help accomplish Goal 1 of poverty reduction by enabling individual to earn higher wages, improving livelihoods through formal & non-formal education, boosting incomes and preventing transmission of poverty generation.

2.5 SDG 4 – TARGETS AND INDICATORS FOR UNIVERSAL EDUCATION (INTENDED)

By 2030, ensure that all girls and boys complete free, equitable and quality primary and secondary education leading to relevant and effective learning outcomes.

2.5.1 Percentage of children/young people (i) in Grade 2/3, (ii) at the end of primary and (iii) at the end of lower secondary achieving at least a minimum proficiency level in (a) reading and (b) mathematics E/CN.3/2016/2 30 disaggregation: sex, location, wealth (and others where data are available)

2.5.2 By 2030, ensure that all girls and boys have access to quality early childhood development, care and pre-primary education so that they are ready for primary education.

2.5.3 Percentage of children under 5 years of age who are developmentally on track in health, learning and psychosocial well-being disaggregation: sex, location, wealth (and others where data are available).

2.5.4 Participation rate in organized learning (one year before the official primary entry age).

2.6 INDICATORS FOR SDG 4 – THE PROCESS AND CURRENT STATUS

In order to formulate an indicator framework for the monitoring of the goals and targets of the post- 2015 development agenda at the global level, and to support its implementation, the United Nations Statistical Commission created an Inter-agency and Expert Group on SDG Indicators (IAEG-SDGs), composed of Member States as well as regional and international agencies as observers (ASER 2016). According the “Report of the Inter-agency and Expert Group (IAEG) on Sustainable Development Goal Indicators” indicators presented for approval at the 47th Statistical Commission session on 8th – 11th March, 2016,

2.7 EDUCATION PORTFOLIO AFTER 18TH CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT OR DEVOLUTION OF POWER IN SINDH

The confluence of the 18th Amendment to the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan and the addition of Article 25-A has profoundly affected the education sector in the country. The former has devolved education as a subject to the provinces. The Constitution, approved in 2010, abolished the Federal Ministry of Education and transferred complete authority to the provinces in matters of education with the proviso that education would be free and compulsory for all children between the ages of 5 and 16, Sindh Education Sector Plan (SESP 2014).

2.8 SINDH STRATEGY FOR SDGs

Sustainable development, which emphasizes the integration between environmental, economic, and social dimensions, is now a top priority at global and national levels. It has been generated by the environmental crisis, which has resulted in the degradation of natural resources as well as diminished quality of life. Sindh is the commercial hub and the gateway of Pakistan. Education has been hailed as the key to the progress of any economy, contributing to improvement in the quality of life and the size of labor pools. Undoubtedly, education is a right for all men and women. However in Pakistan, the aggregate ratio is still skewed towards educating boys and girls education, although steadily improving, is still not given much importance. This is further exacerbated by the fact that the stats allocations for schooling facilities for boys outnumber that for girls at both the primary and secondary levels. Poor infrastructure and inadequate teaching facilities add to the plethora of problems that are limiting progress in the field of education in Sindh,

Sindh Strategy for Sustainable Development Goals (SSSDGs 2016).

2.9 ISSUES AND CHALLENGES TO GOVERNMENT OF SINDH

Sindh is the second largest province in Pakistan and the most urbanized with relatively high rates of unemployment and poverty. One of its most prominent and challenging characteristics is the extent of demographic variations across districts in terms of socio-economic status and educational attainment. A significant percentage of the child population remains uneducated with only the provision of poor quality education and inadequate school infrastructure and resource to support their learning. Schooling of girls is marginalized and as such they are more likely to be out of school consistently across all districts (SESP 2014). Issues in the education sector in Sindh are primarily associated with a lack of organization and planning. There are numerous public sector facilities available such as technical and vocational centers, primary school buildings, teacher-training centers and programmers. However, none of them has ever been utilized to their full potential, nor have they been adequately funded. Instead, a parallel system of education, fed by the private sector and donor-led projects, has been functioning, creating income disparity and varying degrees of quality (SSSDGs). Under this theme the disparities are analyzed based on gender (male, female), geography (rural, urban) and class (where ever data is available), UNESCO (2011).

2.10 PROVINCIAL DEVELOPMENT PRIORITIES FOR EDUCATION

The education sector is intricately connected with the overall developmental context. It is therefore important to understand the overall development context of the Sindh province before embarking upon analysis of the provincial education policy, UNESCO (2011). The components of Sindh education and literacy department are: (i) Increasing Equitable Access to Early Childhood Education, Primary, Middle/Elementary and Secondary education; (ii) Improving the Curriculum and Learning Outcomes; (iii) Improving Teacher Quality; (iv) Strengthening Governance and Service Delivery; (v) Improving Resource Allocation; (vi) Adult Literacy and Non-formal Basic Education; and (vii) Cross-cutting areas (ICT, Education in Emergencies, Gender Equity, Social Cohesion and Public-Private Partnerships for Education). The SESP contains detailed activities for each sub-sector, including but not limited to the net requirements for teachers, infrastructure, equipment and facilities, together with the envisaged role of institutional donors and private sector partners SESP (2014)

2.11 DEVELOPMENT PARTNERS AND COMMUNITY INVOLVEMENT TO ACHIEVE UNIVERSAL EDUCATION IN SINDH

Pakistani Government implemented major plans as Social Action Program (SAP) Phase I (1992-1996) and II (1997-2002) and the Education Sector Reform (2001-2004). Due to this, many CBOs and NGOs initiated leadership roles from among the grassroots level (Memon and Mithani, 2003). The Aga Khan Foundation, Pakistan (AKF,P) and United States Agency for International Development (US-AID) collaboratively helped in promoting the education of preschool and primary education focusing on the rural and semi-urban areas of Sindh (Memon and Mithani, 2003). Various NGOs are playing their part in providing education to the children of the country. Non formal education centers were created in Tehsil Jatoi MuzaffarGarh by a German based organization called Community “KinderNotHlife” known as KNH. The aim was to change the life of children in need. Education status was very poor due to the following reasons: poor infrastructure, non-satisfactory teaching staff, no involvement nor interest shown by neither parents, no inclination to the importance of education, no industries nor opportunities for the educated personnel (Javed, 2012).

Bano (2008) explains that new interventions have been introduced following the education sector reform after 2002. School Management Committees (SMCs) and Village Education have been made into legal bodies that contribute in monitoring, maintain records, and mobilizing the community. NGOs and government joined as partners because NGOs were far more able to reach communities, had good communication skills and proper organized in terms of paper work and material. This is called public-private partnership and has led to improvement in quality of education. This intervention has proven to be a success because 114 districts indicated that 67 percent of them had schools that were run by SMCs, and 31 percent were run by Parent Teacher Associations. Shami and Hussain (as cited in Bano, 2008) state that there were good changes because these interventions ensured teacher attendance was validated, facilities had improved, number of enrollments increased, and the school was successful in generating a lot of resources. Bano (2008) however highlights some issue in this regard including: government not able to deal with local needs as there is no flexibility between government rules, registration is a lengthy process, technical departments not capable of maintaining procedures, CCB members get frustrated as they are not aware to discuss their issue with the relevant department, large projects are awarded to CCBs for political reasons, few people manage the CCB with lack of participation, lots of political people are involved thus institutional problems have reduced the proper functioning of the intervention and system.

In some instances, involvement of parents helped monitor the progress of pupils and curbed absenteeism and provided financial support (Khan et al., 1999; Jamil et al., 2010) however, this partnership could not solve the poor performance students showed on tests, as in the case of The Citizens Foundation (TCF), where it was concluded that good governance (even without the involvement of parents) can result in outstanding performance (Jamil et al., 2010). A

campaign organized by ASER called Chalo Parrho Barrho (Let’s Read and Grow) involved community members. These provided proper water facilities, and installation of fans that have attracted children to attend school regularly (Jamil et al., 2010). Teacher Resource Centre (2004) conducted a case study of two public sector schools that were functioning with limited resources, economic disadvantages and poverty, the aim was to polish the knowledge, skills and abilities of the teachers and to demonstrate techniques of reflection so they could analyze their daily lesson in a critical way to instill a child centered teaching and learning environment. A workshop was conducted where teachers were given the task to rote memorize followed by a test, after this, an activity based learning approach was introduced, the teachers realized the difference between the two and were convinced of the effectiveness of the activity based approach as compared to rote learning.

Majumdar (2006) mentions a case study of West Bengal where many non-conventional schools are managed. Here, rote learning is forbidden and students are immersed in pedagogic experiments where they are encouraged to find out about the geography and history of the place they live e.g. how did their village acquired its name, what occupations have the village dwellers been conducting, structures of houses, information of the main crops of the locality etc. The whole idea is to note their own history and geography before they learn about these topics concerning their nation and the world. They involve their parents, grandparents in knowing the details of the above mentioned data, involving the whole community in the process. Mothers show a lot of enthusiasm for this activity.

2.12 GOVERNMENT’S ALIGNING ITS SESP WITH SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOAL-4

In February 2016, the education and literacy department, Government of Sindh organized a consultative session with policy makers and development partners with the aim to align its targets and policies with the Sustainable Development Goals- Agenda 2030. In the session government tried to align targets of Sindh Education Sector plan (SESP) with the SDGs and its policy framework. Parallel to this the participants including regional and international bodies agreed upon the implementation of SESP would assure further deliberation towards the development of SDG road map for Sindh Province.

2.13 PRIORITIES AND STRATEGIES TO ACHIEVE SDGs-4

The components of SESP are: (i) Increasing Equitable Access to Early Childhood Education, Primary, Middle/Elementary and Secondary education; (ii) Improving the Curriculum and Learning Outcomes; (iii) Improving Teacher Quality; (iv) Strengthening Governance and Service Delivery; (v) Improving Resource Allocation; (vi) Adult Literacy and Non-formal Basic Education; and (vii) Cross-

cutting areas (ICT, Education in Emergencies, Gender Equity, Social Cohesion and Public-Private Partnerships for Education). The SESP contains detailed activities for each sub-sector, including but not limited to the net requirements for teachers, infrastructure, equipment and facilities, together with the envisaged role of institutional donors and private sector partners. The Plan focusses on improving Educational Governance through a number of key actions (training and professional development, establishing a cadre for Education professionals, office space and equipment/logistics, oversight and monitoring, research and development), since more effective governance is a critical precursor to improved service delivery. To increase equitable access to schooling and reduce dropout rates SESP proposes that primary schools be expanded to include middle schools. This will lessen the distance a student must travel to reach school and strengthen student retention in an equitable fashion, whilst reducing unit costs. Early Childhood Education will be expanded substantially, particularly among vulnerable populations. This is expected to increase the initial access to primary schooling along with the likelihood that schools will retain children for a longer period of time, and with greater achievement. Resource conservation and budget restructuring strategies will be identified to support this expansion of services, for example small school consolidation and clustering existing schools for more efficient management and teacher deployment. To improve learning outcomes, SESP proposes several major policy initiatives. Regular evaluations of learning outcomes will become a feature of the sector to inform policy-making and drive budgetary decisions. Teachers will also be provided with tools to conduct ongoing classroom-level assessments of learning in core subjects such as reading and mathematics. This will provide real-time feedback regarding the impact of targeted revisions to the curriculum and to teaching and learning practices.

3. RESEARCH DESIGN

In qualitative research study, we use to describe the events and phenomenon scientifically without using of numerical data in qualitative research (Best & Kahn, 2006). McEwan & McEwan (2003) concur that qualitative research provides opportunities to explain an actual problem in their natural settings. In the study the qualitative methodology has been applied to explore estimations, mechanism of organizational performance in educational field, the perception of international and national organizations about the universal education achievements going smoothly or not (Creswell,1994). The inquiry process of qualitative study helps researcher to understand complex social and administrative problems, give us the holistic picture of the problem in their natural settings (Creswell, 1994). Those problems that require further exploration, qualitative research are the best option to explore the problem in their natural settings (Creswell, 2007). Merriam (2009) described that qualitative research uses a holistic process to utilize data collection and data analysis processes that are significantly descriptive in nature. McMillan & Schumacher (1993)

defined the case study is as an inquiry in which the main focus is on one phenomenon. Merriam (1998) stated that case study has a rich description of the phenomenon under the study. Case study is a methodology that maintains very deep connections to the core values, and intentions of study (Merriam, 2009). It is an analysis and investigation of one single or collective cases aims to find out the complexities of the study (Stake, 1995). The participants of this case study are all the heads of different units of education and literacy department government of Sindh, like Sindh Education Foundation (SEF), Reforms Support Unit (RSU) and Public Private Partnership. Parallel to these in development partners, World Bank, IMF, USAID, European Union and all local and regional organizations. In this research study the interviews were conducted from chief manager of RSU, director of public private partnership and director of monitoring unit. Head of IRC as development partner and prominent member of board who developed the Sindh Strategy for Sustainable Development Goals as community participant. Interviews are a structured or unstructured form of communication taking place between the researcher and the subject for which the interview is taking place. The participants of this case study are all the heads of different units of education and literacy department government of Sindh, like Sindh Education Foundation (SEF), Reforms Support Unit (RSU) and Public Private Partnership. Parallel to these in development partners, World Bank, IMF, USAID, European Union and all local and regional organizations. In this research study the interviews were conducted from chief manager of RSU, director of public private partnership and director of Sindh Schools Monitoring System (SSMS). Head of IRC as development partner and prominent members of board who developed the Sindh Strategy for Sustainable Development Goals as community participant. Document analysis is a qualitative data collection technique, in which researcher interprets the documents and gives authenticity and meaning to the research topic. The document analyzing gives coding content into the themes similar interviews analyzed methods (UCSD). In this research study three types of documents were analyzed. In public record all the official ongoing projects, activities, programs, strategic plans and mission statement were included. At the second, all the annual reports of the government institutes, like annual economic survey report of Pakistan, State Bank annual report and RSU update report. Third document based evidence in the study was included reports and updates of regional and international organizations.

4. RESULTS

Following are the fundamental themes that emerged in this study in context of monitoring and evaluation of universal education performance and progress in the province for Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) targets. The themes, examines different development agendas, policies and programs and their complex interrelationship and links between government and key development partners in the

education sector. In context of SDGs, the emergent themes include: Reason for monitoring and evolution of universal education for SDGs in Sindh, overarching steps that may help full to assist reviving and monitoring education agenda 2030, in province. The themes also show why and how universal education is important for other development sectors of SDGs.

4.1 EDUCATIONAL POLICIES OF SINDH

The 18th Amendment to Pakistan's Constitution, approved in 2010, abolished the Federal Ministry of Education and transferred complete authority to the provinces in matters of education with the proviso that education would be free and compulsory for all children between the ages of 5 and 16. In this regard government of Sindh developed Sindh Education Sector Plan (SESP), the ever first policy document of the province regarding education. It continues to be guided by the National Education Policy (NEP) 2009, but represents a significantly new vision of education goals and possibilities specific to the rapidly evolving context of the province.

4.2 CURRENT SINDH EDUCATION PROFILE

Sindh is the second largest province in Pakistan and the most urbanized with relatively high rates of unemployment and poverty. One of its most prominent and challenging characteristics is the extent of demographic variations across districts in terms of socio-economic status and educational attainment. Education is an indispensable component of human development and a basic right of every citizen. Pakistan is committed to promote education, increase literacy rate, capacity building of teachers, and enhancement of facilities in all educational institutes. Federal and provincial governments are committed to provide free education up to the Matric level.

National and provincial governments are encouraging and facilitating the private sector to invest in the education sector for its promotion as a national cause. Pakistan Vision 2025 aims at substantial expansion as well improvements in the quality of education, increasing public expenditure to 4.0 percent of GDP by 2018. Comprehensive reforms, comprising of detailed actions in curriculum, pedagogy, technology, governance, assessment as well as social and economic relevance will be made in the educational system to improve the quality of public schooling.

However, despite positive developments Sindh continues to underperform as seen by the primary GER, NER and GPI falling below the national average. The data highlights the major determinant as students dropping out from school when transitioning from primary to middle school.

4.3 GOVERNMENT'S ALIGNING ITS PLANS WITH SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOAL-4

In February 2016, the education and literacy department, Government of Sindh organized a consultative session with policy makers and development partners with the aim to align its targets and policies with the Sustainable Development Goals- Agenda 2030. In the session government tried to align targets of Sindh Education Sector plan (SESP) with the SDGs and its policy framework. Parallel to this the participants including regional and international bodies agreed upon the implementation of SESP would assure further deliberation towards the development of SDG road map for Sindh Province.

4.4 CONTROVERSIES IN THE TARGETS OF SESP AND SDG-4

The analysis provides a complete picture of the targets and achievement for the SDGs 2030. There are bigger differences among SDG-4 and Sindh Education Sector Plan 2014. The SESP has set targets with regard to various reform initiatives being taken by the Sindh Government towards the education development by increasing access from 34 percent to 50 percent quality and improved governance for 2018, whereas SDG-4 emphasize the nations to achieve universal education 100 percent by 2030.

4.5 PROGRAM DESIGNING FOR ACHIEVEMENTS OF SDG-4

The Government of Sindh with the collaboration of development partners have been designed various programs and developed policies to take into account existing capacity within the system.

Many will require close monitoring to guard against unintended side effects, for instance school Consolidation must ensure that schools remain within easy walking distance for children, and double shifting must not result in loss of time available for teaching and learning.

4.5.1 EDUCATION MANAGEMENT (EM)

This initiative of education management is imitative taken by education department to separate teaching and administrative cadres in order to strengthen both the fields so that there is efficiency in the system and desired results are achieved.

4.5.2 POLICY AND GOVERNANCE

The education department faces great challenges to implementation of school consolidation policy. The need for the consolidation arose due to poor planning in the past, schools with one room or two rooms with one teacher was not a fair deal at all and it witnessed poor quality of service delivery. In this program of school consolidation, in schools of high enrolment increased resources in terms of teachers and infrastructure.

4.5.3 SCHOOL MANAGEMENT COMMITTEES (SMC)

These committees are formed for better management of schools. It comprises on five members of body elected from

community and school. The SMCs are given funds annually on the basis of class rooms and student ratio.

4.5.4 SCHOOL INFRASTRUCTURE DEVELOPMENT (SID)

The objective of this initiative is to improve the infrastructure and ensure the provision of the basic facilities such as water, washroom, boundary walls, shelter-less schools provided with buildings.

4.5.5 TEACHERS PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT (TPM)

To enhance the pedagogical skills of teachers, it is important to strengthen through various programs which develop their academic and practical knowledge.

4.5.6 TEACHER RECRUITMENT (TR)

In order to provide quality education to the students, it is of utmost importance that teachers should recruit on merit basis. The mechanism of recruitment was initiated by Government of Sindh in year 2012. For this department of education hired the services of National Testing Service (NTS).

4.5.7 STANDARDIZED ACHIEVEMENT TEST (SAT)

Reform Support Unit, Education and literacy Department initiated Standardized Achievement Testing in the year 2012-13 to assess the achievement level of students of class V to VIII. Students have been appearing in this test since then in order to provide a real time picture of the quality of education being provided.

4.5.8 PROMOTING PRIVATE SCHOOLING IN RURAL SINDH (PPRS)

Department of Education has established a separate node dedicated for the program of Public Private Partnership to increase to increase access and to improve the quality of educational services with the support of private sector. The PPRS intervention focusses on ensuring that the children in the marginalized areas have access to quality education.

4.6 INFORMATION AND INCENTIVES

4.6.1 FREE TEXT BOOKS (FTB)

The books being provided free from the age of 5 years to 16 years has become compulsory. The books being provided are prepared under the Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs) based curriculum 2006.

4.6.2 GIRLS' STIPENDS (GS)

The girls students from class 6th to 10th are being provide with annual stipends. In the year 2014-15 ATM cards were distributed to girls' students.

4.6.3 SINDH EDUCATION MANAGEMENT INFORMATION SYSTEM (SEMICS)

The objectives of SEMIS are to conduct annual census for public schools, to provide timely information to the policy makers and collect data about the physical infrastructure, enrolment and human resource information.

4.6.4 SINDH SCHOOL MONITORING SYSTEM (SSMS)

The functions of system are to monitor accountability, implementation and performance besides teachers and students attendance. Independent monitors being monitor under the supervision of Directorate General of Monitoring and Evaluation with the help of World Bank Technical Assistance (WB TA).

5. CONCLUSION

The necessity of improving educational quality and designing of policies and programs for Sustainable Development in order to increase general understanding is being stressed by various international organizations at different platforms. In the means of implementation of the SDGs in the province, the Government still did not define the strategies and outcomes MDGs. Various programs of Sindh Government are looking for funds to build and upgrade education system that provide safe and non-violent, effective learning environment for all. Whereas most of the funds released from annual provincial budget and other donors organizations are useless or non-productive. The Government tackles this inequity in the provision of and participation in education as the most important cross-cutting theme in the sector, and the organizing principle around which policies and programs will be implemented over the next 15 years period. It addresses both access to education and quality of learning outcomes through the prism of equity. It takes the perspective that Education for All (EFA) will not be achieved until specific strategies are designed for the most marginalized children. It also articulates an approach under which access and learning quality must be tackled jointly, given the clear evidence that depressed levels of learning. Contribute to the province's extraordinarily high dropout rates and minimal progress regarding overall enrolment rates.

5.1 DISCUSSION

Sindh is the second largest province in Pakistan and the most urbanized with relatively high rates of unemployment and poverty. One of its most prominent and challenging characteristics is the extent of demographic variations across districts in terms of socio-economic status and educational attainment. A significant percentage of the child population

remains uneducated with only the provision of poor quality education and inadequate school infrastructure and resource to support their learning. Schooling of girls is marginalized and as such they are more likely to be out of school consistently across all districts. Provide equitable and inclusive quality education and life-long learning opportunities Attain gender equality, empower women and girls everywhere Secure water and sanitation for all for a sustainable world Ensure access to affordable, sustainable, and reliable modern energy services for all Promote strong, inclusive and sustainable economic growth and decent work for all Proposed SDG 4 related to education aims at finishing the task of universal primary education by reaching out to the remaining out of school children and focusing on quality of education rather than enrolments as the progress indicator. Education-related SDGs also relate to improving access to lower secondary education in order to meet the requirement of children completing primary education. The MDGs have been criticized for being too narrow and applicable only to the poor countries and to be achieved through the support of the wealthy nations. On the other hand, the proposed SDGs are broader in scope and are applicable to all the countries. MDGs were expected to take the nations halfway to the goals, however, the SDGs aim at reaching to the statistical zero and finish the task at hand. Education and Literacy Department, Government of Sindh has recruited 225 monitoring assistants through Sindh Global Partnership for education for effective and regular monitoring of schools in 15 elected districts of Sindh. The program is very important to capture the teachers' attendance through biometric within a school and collect students' enrolment data in addition to capture school infrastructure details. The second one major step towards SDGs achievement is National Enrolment Drive, in which Government had made many efforts to enhance Net Enrolment Ratio (NER) and address the issues of decreasing enrolment and drop-out of the students from school across the Province. In terms of SDGs-4 that binds every state and country to promote gender equality in education and aims to eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education by 2030. In the province, more than 24 percent students from age 5 to 16 years out of school. The overall education situation based on major indicators, like Net Enrolment, number of schools and teachers shows poor improvement to achieve SDGs targets by 2030 in Sindh.

5.2 RECOMMENDATIONS

In this study the researcher concluded there are various weaknesses in the policy making and its implementation to achieve SDGs targets. The followings are the recommendations of this evidence based research study, about the problems identified in the study.

- Government should improve Educational Governance through a number of key actions (training and professional development, establishing a cadre for Education professionals, office space

and equipment/logistics, oversight and monitoring, research and development), since more effective governance is a critical precursor to improved service delivery.

- Government should ensure to increase equitable access to schooling and reduce dropout rates.
- Early Childhood Education should be expanded substantially, particularly among vulnerable populations. By doing this this is expected to increase the initial access to primary schooling along with the likelihood that schools will retain children for a longer period of time, and with greater achievement.
- To improve learning outcomes, government should propose several policies, like regular evaluations of learning outcomes. Teachers should also provide modern tools and techniques to conduct on going classroom-level assessment of learning in core subjects. Quality assurance standards should be increase, focus on outcomes rather than inputs.
- To improve teaching quality, all new teacher recruitment and advancement should be merit-based and qualified.
- Education sector financing should be refocused for greater impact and transparency through a series of proposed measures.
- The Government should focus on reducing inequity and improving overall quality is consistent with its broader socioeconomic development strategy, which highlight the need to reduce poverty and regional income inequality. The Sindh government should take initiatives for fiscal reforms to increase its tax base and improve the delivery of social services. A core part of this effort is to revive the rural economy, in part through increased engagement of the private sector actors.

REFERENCES:

1. Bamberger, Michael (2000) Integrating Quantitative and Qualitative Methods in Development Projects, World Bank Publications.
2. Greene and Jennifer. C. (2007). "Mixed Methods in Social Inquiry". Sage Publications; Journal of Mixed Methods Research. Sage Publications. <http://mmr.sagepub.com>.
3. Mc Keown (2017). "Education for Sustainable Development and Decade of education for Sustainable Develop. Open Working Group on Sustainable Development Goals. http://www.itacec.org/document/owg/OWG%20brief_Equitable%20Learning.pdf
4. Education for All – Global Monitoring Report <http://www.itacec.org/efa.php> Center for Global Development (2006) "Education and the Developing

- World: Why is education essential for development". Washington, D.C. CGD.
5. EFAGMR (The Education For All Global Monitoring Report team) (2013) "Proposed post-2015 education goals: Emphasizing equity, measurability and finance" Paris: UNESCO.
 6. The Society for the Advancement of Education (SAHE), (2014). "Education Monitor: Reviewing quality of key education inputs in Pakistan". Accessed from: www.sahe.org.pk/images/Education_Monitor.pdf
 7. Teacher's Resource Center (TRC), (2004). "A story of school improvement". Accessed from: <http://trconline.org/category/research-studies/>
 - 8.
 9. Trochim, W. M.K., (2006). Research Methods knowledge base: Qualitative Methods. Accessed from: <http://www.socialresearchmethods.net/kb/qualmeth.php>
 10. The Society for the Advancement of Education (SAHE), 2014. Education Monitor: Reviewing quality of key education inputs in Pakistan. Accessed from: www.sahe.org.pk/images/Education_Monitor.pdf
 11. Ramachandran, V., (2003). "Backward and Forward Linkages That Strengthen Primary Education". Economic and Political Weekly, Vol. 38, No. 10, pp. 959-968. Accessed from: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/4413309>
 12. Nelson, M. J., (2006). "Muslims, Markets, and the Meaning of a "Good" Education in Pakistan". Asian Survey, Vol. 46, No. 5, pp. 699-720. Accessed from: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.1525/as.2006.46.5.699>
 13. Memon, M., Mithani, S. (2003). "Enhancing institutional capacity building of non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and community based organizations (CBOs): Impact of an innovative initiative. Impact: Making a difference". Accessed from: http://ecommons.aku.edu/book_chapters/46
 14. Javed, N., (2012). "Pakistan Annual Report 2012: Provision of education by strengthening of education environment for the flood affected children through community participation in Tehsil Jatoi MuzaffarGarh". Research Advocacy and Social Training Institute (RASTI). Accessed from: rastipakistan.org/pdfs/RASTI-Jatoi_Annual_Report.pdf
 15. Gazdar, H. (1999). "Universal Basic Education in Pakistan: A Commentary on Strategy and Results of a Survey". Sustainable Development Policy Institute. Working Paper Series # 39. Accessed from: [https://sdpi.org/publications/files/W39 Universal%20Basic%20Education%20in%20Pakistan.pdf](https://sdpi.org/publications/files/W39%20Universal%20Basic%20Education%20in%20Pakistan.pdf)
 16. Brophy, J. (1985). "Interactions of male and female students with male and female teachers". In L.C. Wilkinson & C.B Marrett (Eds), Gender influences in classroom interaction; New York Academic Press
 17. Hallinger, P., & Heck, R. H. (1996). "Reassessing the principal's role in school effectiveness: A review of empirical research, 1980-1995". Educational Administration Quarterly, 32(1), 5-44
-