

Exploring the Significance of Hiring Effective Tutors in the Eyes of Parents and Tutees

Hannah Kristien G. Sadsad, Shirley M. Autida, John Carlo E. Cruz, Nancy D. Manlutac, Laica P. Garcia, Rose Lynn D. Villanueva, MAGC

College of Education, Don Honorio Ventura State University, Cabambangan, Bacolor, Pampanga, Philippines

hannahkristiensadsad1@gmail.com

Abstract: *As the economy progresses, parents in many families have been busier than ever. Most of them rely on tutors to monitor their child's education. This study explored the worth of having a tutor in the eyes of parents, tutees, and tutors themselves. Specifically, it answered queries on the characteristics of tutors that parents look for, the teaching strategies of the tutors they hire and why they hire tutors for their children. Further, the study also explored the characteristics that tutors see in themselves, why are they worth hiring and the teaching strategies that they usually use in tutoring. The study also included how tutees viewed their tutors as part of their aid in studying. Purposive sampling was used in selecting the key informants that included fifteen (15) parents, fifteen (15) tutors, and fifteen (15) tutees who resided in different municipalities and cities of Pampanga. A descriptive-exploratory design was utilized through a validated interview guide composed of semi-structured questions. For data gathering, interview transcripts were analyzed using the Reflexive Thematic Analysis as by Braun and Clarke (2019). In this study, seven (7) themes emerged: a) characteristics of tutors as perceived by the parents; b) characteristics of the tutors as perceived by tutor-informants; c) teaching strategies used by the tutors as perceived by the parents; d) teaching strategies used by the tutors; e) qualities of worthy tutors as perceived by the parents; f) qualities of a worthy tutor as perceived by tutor-informants; and g) relevance of tutoring on the school performance of the tutees.*

Keywords—tutors, tutees, parents, tutoring, Philippines

1. INTRODUCTION

Parents, in general, want to give all the best to their children, and one of the investments that they can give to their child is an excellent education. Today, children worldwide continue studying with tutors after their usual school lessons (Mwebi & Maithya, 2016). Children all throughout the world now continue studying with tutors after their regular class hours (Mwebi & Maithya, 2016). Typically, tutoring is the only form of learning assistance provided to a student by a person qualified to lead them. It can take place both within and outside of the four walls of the classroom (Iversen & Subedi, 2018).

After several years of significant changes in the education sector, parents and educators are looking for ways to narrow the learning gap for students. Around 1.6 billion children in 194 countries were affected by school closures at their height in early April 2020, accounting for more than 90% of all enrolled students (UNESCO, 2020).

Not only for students who are struggling in school, tutoring is also available for high achievers who want to add to their skill set in order to maintain or improve their academic performance. Private tutoring is frequently offered by people or institutions that parents would preferably know, and is intended to provide pupils a better chance to successfully transition to the next grade level (Choi & Park, 2016).

Stastny and Walterová (2019) characterized private tutoring as a learning style that is closely related to public education, a hybrid of public and private education, and a substitute for the state-supported, ineffective public education system. The demand for private schools is driven by a more pressing need for a personalized approach to students, which parents view as a prerequisite for their child's success. However, this does not always mean that private schools are of more excellent quality because quality varies between educational systems.

As per Mwebi and Maithya (2016), private tutoring has improved children's average grades, overall school performance, particularly academic performance, and their understanding of a wide range of subjects. Despite the fact that tutoring is thought to be beneficial, Park, Buchmann, Choi, and Merry (2016) contend that there is still inconsistent evidence from longitudinal research examining selection bias among taught and untutored students.

The program regularly and significantly enhances learning results, as indicated by Nickow et al., (2020). Compared to non-professional and parent tutoring, the results of teacher and paraprofessional assistance are more obvious. However, Otto and Karbach (2019) found that there is currently insufficient evidence to support the use of private tutoring as a method for enhancing academic achievement.

Akimenko (2017) stated that private tutoring significantly improves students' English proficiency since it acts as a corrective measure to assist them to acquire the academic knowledge needed. Guill et al., (2021) countered that there is little evidence that private tutoring improves academic achievement or the particular circumstances of successful private tutoring. Regression models with numerous variables were undertaken, however neither one of the school subjects looked at exhibited a positive main impact of private tutoring attendance. Furthermore, they have never been able to find any evidence of a beneficial relationship between tutoring duration, intensity, content (such as a focus on homework completion, test preparation, or study behavior), or students' willingness to attend private tutoring among the subsamples of tutored students.

It does not recommend private tutoring as a general strategy for raising academic performance, according to the statistics of Ömeroğulları et al., (2020). There is no proof that more experienced tutors or longer tutoring sessions are consistently more beneficial. Under some circumstances, such as the interaction of prior knowledge, tutor certification, and school subject, some kids may benefit from tutoring. Additionally, they claimed that the success and learning behavior of children may be positively impacted by non-cognitive factors such as student motivation or family concerns. Students and parents should routinely check to see if the anticipated academic progress takes place when the purpose of private tutoring is to improve academic performance.

Parents and students have resorted to public school teachers in particular for private tutoring to supplement what they are learning in class. The extra income has been well-received by teachers and other administrators. Consequently, tutoring has permeated many students' and teachers' lives, diverting time and resources from education. However, the continuous operation of the educational systems has been facilitated by private tutoring (Choi & Park, 2016).

Due to the fact that private tutoring is now a worldwide demand and since education is seen as a significant contributor to a nation's wealth, it is a crucial area of study. The main cause of the rise in demand for private tutoring is low student performance in the majority of countries. Nonetheless, varying cultures, nations, and educational systems have different definitions of what private tutoring entails (Byun et al., 2018).

Along with additional benefits, private education raises academic achievement and broadens knowledge across many fields. Student deficiencies and teacher ignorance may be two main causes for more private tutoring. Academic gains from private tutoring are possible for kids, and tutors themselves will develop. In some cases, private tutoring has developed to

bridge the gap between insufficient educational frameworks and citizens' requirements, and it is becoming more and more prevalent every day (Chui, 2016).

Grey and Osborne (2020) reported that some parents think that pushing their kids to work hard will help them become competent and successful, as opposed to parents who think that having the freedom to move forward limits advancement and may accentuate their child's performance. Likewise, they claimed that tutors should assist learners transition beyond theoretical to productive students in universities by supporting their personal, professional, and academic progress. Given the fact that parents who had less formal education themselves did not have the knowledge to help and support their children in elementary school, they nevertheless want to give their children the best education possible by paying for tutoring.

Hajar (2018) explored how students claimed that their tutor helped them achieve their ideal self-image by boosting their self-esteem and enthusiasm for learning as well as boosting their self-assurance in social situations (i.e. intangible benefits). The pupils acted as agents, taking into account both the advantages and disadvantages of tutoring, such as the pressure it would put on their parents and the competitive advantage it might give them.

This paper sought to explore the worth of having a tutor from the eyes of parents, tutees and tutors themselves. However, it delved more closely at the factors that led parents to hire tutors for their children. Consequently, the study also examined the advantages and disadvantages of hiring a tutor as well as the value of having one as part of a child's education.

2. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

Scaffolding theory and maturational theory both support this study. Bruner's scaffolding theory was substantially influenced by the work of Russian psychologist Lev Vygotsky and first presented in 1976 as a component of social constructivism theory. Vygotsky stressed that people learn best in a social environment where they may communicate with others and create meaning, while Bruner highlighted that children need active support from teachers and other adults when they start to learn new concepts. Based on these views, it is evident that tutors and tutees have three different sorts of linkages between them (Yaman, 2019). The connection can be anchored from Vygotsky's scaffolding assistance provided to students to aid in their learning (Haider & Yasmin (2015).

According to Vygotsky (1987), learning happens when children engage in activities within their Zone of Proximal Development (ZPD) that are too challenging for them to complete alone. However, they are more likely to succeed if an adult or a peer with more experience helps them. Children

are more likely to learn and fully comprehend an idea when they are actively engaged in it.

Prior knowledge, such as ingrained routines at home, affects what children are learning in school. From an early age, parents serve as their children's primary teachers, therefore they need to pay close attention to what their kids are learning. Parents should devote their time to teaching their children, but what if they are unable to devote the necessary time or have insufficient knowledge to teach the lesson? As they concentrate on other areas of what they can give to their children, parents' role as learning facilitators becomes ineffective or maybe none at all. Thus, to meet their children's needs in terms of specific academic demands, parents opt to hire tutors. Alongside this scenario, the child's surroundings expand from the parents, teachers and tutor that results to a rich participation in the child's learning process. These experiences, therefore, help the child's cognitive capacities. As tutoring is part of the culture and connections the tutee receives, Vygotsky's theory directs the inquiry into how tutoring aids the tutees in improving their academic performance.

The Maturational Theory is focused on the mental and physical growth of children. Gesell (1925) believed that children will have to go through these developmental phases in the same order. Each child could advance at his/her own rate as well. He claimed that a person's genetic makeup determined their developmental patterns. By boosting their self-esteem, willingness to study, and self-confidence in social circumstances, tutoring helped students achieve their ideal self-image (Hajar, 2018).

Moreover, Benckwitz et al. (2022) found that private tutoring is regarded as a beneficial method for raising student achievement. According to studies that demonstrate how a child's environment affects their behavior, children who are directed in their advancement have a favorable influence on both their physical and mental development.

The majority of students and parents believed that private tutoring improved their child's academic performance. This finding might persuade students and parents to use private tutoring in the future and may have a positive effect on students' motivation and feelings toward the subject being tutored (Benckwitz et al., 2022).

3. STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

This study explored the worth of having a tutor in the eyes of parents, tutees, and tutors through the following questions.

1. What are the characteristics of tutors that parents look for?
2. What are the qualities that they see in themselves?

3. What are the teaching strategies that parents see in the tutors of their children?
4. What are the teaching strategies that tutors use in tutoring their tutees?
5. What makes a tutor worth hiring in the eyes of parents?
6. What makes a tutor worth hiring in the eyes of tutors?
7. What is the significance of tutoring on the school performance of the students based on their personal perspectives?

4. METHODS

4.1 Research Design

This research used a qualitative approach where non-numerical data is collected and analyzed to better understand the concepts, opinions, or experiences (Bhandari, 2020).

The descriptive exploratory design was used in this study. Exploratory research offers information that help researchers better grasp the problem and is adaptable enough to take into account all aspects of the issue (Surbhi, 2017).

To demonstrate the benefits of having tutors and how tutors support the academic success of the students, the researchers used descriptive exploratory design and qualitative approaches. The main purpose of the study is to analyze the worth of hiring a tutor through the eyes of parents, tutees and tutors themselves.

4.2 Sampling Technique

The researchers used the purposive sampling technique in selecting participants in this study. Crossman (2020) identified that purposive sampling is a non-probability sample. It is selected based on the objective of the study and the population's characteristics. It is also known as subjective, selective, and judgmental sampling. Purposive sampling is where researchers select a sample based on the study's needs. The study used the purposive sampling technique at which point the key informants shall meet specific qualifications for them to be viable.

The criteria that were utilized in selecting the key informants were: (1) parent-informants who hired tutors for their children for a minimum of 2 years; (2) parent-informants whose children are being tutored for 3-6 days a week; (3) tutee-informants who have tutored for a minimum of 2 years, ages 6-12 years old and being tutored 3-6 days a week; and (4) tutor-informants who have tutored for more than 3 years.

The researchers preferred that key informants represent those who are both in public and private schools. For a safer

number of key informants, the researchers looked for fifteen (15) parent-informants, fifteen (15) tutee-informants, and fifteen (15) tutor-informants.

4.3 Setting of the Study

The study was conducted in the different municipalities and cities of Pampanga, specifically in Arayat, Lubao, Candaba, Florida, and lastly, Bacolor.

4.4 Research Instrument

The research instrument was an interview guide with semi-structured questions that were validated by three experts in the field of research. Some questions are open-ended so that the key informants could provide a rich information of the data needed to meet the objectives of the study. The validated interview guide is deemed to provide a complete picture of the facets of the topic.

The semi-structured questions provide clear instructions for the interview and can provide reliable data. A semi-structured guide is a form of data collection that includes asking of questions within a specified theme framework (George, 2022).

4.5 Ethical Considerations

In conducting research studies, different ethical concerns were considered. For this study, the researchers asked for permission before administering an interview. Key-informants have the right to reject and/or withdraw if they wanted to do so. The researchers explained properly the objectives of the study.

Key informants were coded and were assured of the data's strict confidentiality and anonymity pursuant to the Data Privacy Act of 2012. They were informed that the data was for educational purposes only. Response validation was sought from the key informants to validate the transcription of the interview.

4.6 Data Analysis

The thematic analysis approach is an increasingly popular method of qualitative data analysis at the same time it is accessible and flexible. Qualitative researchers are learning to do it to provide a foundation on the basic skills needed to engage with other approaches to qualitative data analysis (Braun & Clarke, 2012). Reflexive thematic analysis is a technique for qualitative data analysis that is simple to use and conceptually flexible, and that makes it easier to identify and analyze patterns or themes in a given data set. (Braun and Clarke, 2012, as cited in Byrne, 2021).

Following are the six (6) step processes in conducting thematic analysis. (1) Familiarization with the data, researchers transcribed the recordings into text form. (2)

Coding the data, after transcribing the data and understanding it, researchers identified the main features of the data. (3) Generating initial themes, researchers identified the initial themes in the data after coding, these themes formed the basis of the thematic analysis. (4) Reviewing the themes, researchers identified the research objectives that are appropriate and sufficient to ensure that thematic analysis is going in the direction, and researchers can make final changes in the themes and criteria as needed. (5) Naming and defining the themes, researchers set boundaries and make distinctions between the data. (6) Writing, after naming and identifying the themes, researchers wrote up the report for thematic analysis, the report should be formal. All the sections of formal reports included the introduction, literature review, methodology result, observation, and conclusion.

Data source triangulation approach is combining data, methodologies, ideas, and/or investigators to respond to a research inquiry. It is a research strategy that can help you improve your findings' validity and trustworthiness (Bhandari, 2022). The use of triangulation has been considered as having the possibility of increasing the study's validity and decreasing its cost researcher bias and giving a variety of viewpoints factors being investigated (Denzin, 1970).

The researcher must either reframe the research topic, reassess the methodology, or do both when only one technique was used to address a particular issue and two out of three approaches produced the same results or all three produced inconsistent results (Naeem, 2019).

As a result, the researcher gets a more thorough and comprehensive understanding of the occasion or circumstance under investigation. As shown by advocates of data triangulation, the major goal of using this method is to present a more thorough and impartial assessment of the issue (Altrichter et al., 1996). When employed in qualitative research, this approach can be described as an effort to thoroughly map out and explain the richness and complexity of human behavior by evaluating it from a variety of angles (Carr et al., 1986). Through a data analyst, the researchers were able to validate and double-check crucial informant transcriptions, code key points, and generate themes and subthemes.

5. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

The findings of the study were obtained from fifteen (15) selected parents of elementary students, fifteen (15) elementary tutors, and fifteen (15) elementary tutees. There were forty-five (45) key informants who were purposively selected having the following criteria: (1) parents who hired tutors for their children for a minimum of 2 years; (2) parents whose children are being tutored for 3-6 days a week; (3)

tutees who have tutored for a minimum of two years, ages 6-12 years old and being tutored 3-6 days a week; and (4) tutors who have tutored for more than three years. For confidentiality, the key informants of the study were coded to TR which stands for Tutor, P which stands for Parent, and TTE which stands for Tutee. Seven themes have emerged from Braun and Clarke's (2019) six-phase reflexive thematic analysis of the data.

Characteristics of Tutors and Perceived by the Parents and Tutor-Informants

As per problem statement of this study, the above-mentioned theme was created. The parent-informants gave their perspectives on the characteristics of a tutor. After the analysis, six (6) sub-themes emerged: college graduate, knowledgeable on all the subjects, patient and diligent, good communication skills, flexible, and kind. In accordance with the statement of the problem, the above-mentioned theme was formulated. This theme was about the description and assessment of the tutor-informants regarding their skills and competencies. After analyzing the responses of the informants, there were six (6) meaningful sub-themes that emerged: good communication skills, having self-confidence, knowledgeable about the subjects, flexible, strict and kind, and patient.

Both parents and tutor-informants stated the characteristics they perceived of tutors. Parent-informants mentioned that one of the qualities they perceived in a tutor is being knowledgeable. Parent-informants pondered that the tutor they need in educating their child must be at least a college graduate and knowledgeable about all subjects so that their children would be educated more precisely and clearly. The parent-informants claimed that the tutor for their children has a college degree. According to Wyzant (2022), considering a tutor's education may be the first thing that comes to parents' minds when looking for a competent tutor. Parents may typically get the tutoring support their child needs from someone who has at least a Bachelor's degree.

"That's why I'm hiring a tutor for my child who has at least a college degree"-P2

"A BEED graduate with at least having an experience in teaching." -P3

"I prefer the one who is a graduate with a bachelor's degree in elementary education and must have enough knowledge on all subjects." -P7

Parent-informants prefer to engage with a tutor who is well-versed in all subjects in order to meet all of their child's needs. This was also supported by the narratives of the tutor-informants, who are fully aware of the fact that they must be knowledgeable enough to be able to provide all the needs of

their tutees. A tutor must be experienced and completely familiar with all the subject's principles, ideas, and issues (Liden, 2013).

They added that having knowledge of several subjects gave them assurance to instruct and teach others since it widened their perspective. In relation to this, South Central College (2019) said categorically that broad subject-matter knowledge is one of the most crucial skills a tutor must possess.

"It's important that the tutor understands all subjects because it will be difficult for him/her to study if he/she didn't know what he/she teaching." -P1

"Having a mastery of a lesson is a requirement to impart knowledge to your tutee." -P3

"It's quite difficult to teach the subjects that you are not used to teaching, but as an educator, it is always good to learn new things and new lessons from different subject areas. For me, it's not that hard to adopt as long as there is a willingness to learn." -TR13

"Of course, as an elementary teacher and tutor, we must be knowledgeable in all subjects, not just some subjects like Math or English. So, as a teacher, whatever subject I'm assigned, I can adapt and I'm flexible to teach different subjects."-TR6

Moreover, another set of characteristics of a tutor that was perceived by parent-informants and tutor-informants is the personal characteristics of a tutor that they convey.

Parent-informants emphasized that they were searching for a tutor who is committed to teaching children, industrious, and patient. Being flexible allows tutors to adapt to a wide range of tutee's skills, needs, and interests. An article identified that when looking for a tutor for their children, parents would most likely look for a tutor who can swiftly adapt and change their teaching and communication style (Pragya, 2019).

Tutor-informants claimed that they were flexible when it comes to tutoring children. The capacity to quickly and abruptly change one's teaching method is referred to as flexibility. It requires incorporating feedback and making quick adjustments to one's lesson in response to certain situations (Mendoza, 2019).

"Being flexible can meet all the needs of my child." -P3

"Tutors must be ready for any difficulties and know how to relate well with parents." -P5

"The tutor must be flexible at all times because they give a lot of activities from different subjects." -P13

"Flexibility is one of the character traits that the mentor should possess, being adaptable to every situation is a must.

Just like the pandemic we have to embrace the new normal because of the unavoidable circumstances.” -TR5

“In tutoring you must be flexible and ready; you must know what you teach. I can say that I am flexible about what I must do.” -TR9

Another personal characteristic that was perceived by parent-informants and tutor-informants is the good communication skills and self-confidence of a tutor. They believed that a tutor with good communication skills could instruct their students in a straightforward and exact manner.

Parent-informants mentioned that good communication skills are crucial for tutors since they make it simpler for them to teach their tutee. To be respectful, amiable, diplomatic, a good listener, and able to forge bonds, one must possess good communication skills. It is essential to remember that communication is more than just talking, both verbal and visual communication methods are used in optimal communication (Zlatovic, 2018).

The tutor-informants believed that they were effective communicators. They said that their vast teaching and tutoring experience allowed them to enhance these talents. A good tutor is able to explain their subject matter knowledge to the tutee in a clear and understandable manner. Speech, clarity, the usage of expressions of gratitude, gestures, and more are all components of effective communication (Pragya, 2019).

“Good communication skill is important because interacting with my child will help them become comfortable.” -P3

“Communication skills are very important in order to transmit the message to the pupil in a clear and understandable manner.” -P7

“By expressing my ideas effectively using oral, written, visual and non-verbal communication skills as well as listening skills to gain understanding.” -TR7

“I am confident enough to teach because as an educator. I think that one of the best abilities to have is being able to share your knowledge and skills with your students.” -TR13

The parent-informants and tutor-informants also indicated patience as one of the characteristics of a tutor. A tutor may impart knowledge to a tutee when they have both patience and diligence in tutoring. In addition to cognitive and educational qualifications, the parents considered personal qualities and attitudes, such as patience and diligence, in tutors for their children. They can be effective tutors because they are patient while working with tutees who have different learning styles. Hard work, punctuality, and diligence are some of the basic self-disciplines that a tutor must possess (Pragya, 2019).

Tutor-informants claimed that they improved their capacity for patience throughout the course of their work as tutors. A tutor-informant mentioned that having patience is beneficial for a tutor in terms of successfully providing their tutees with the necessary number of sessions. Walczak (2015) stressed the capacity for patience with the viewpoints, shortcomings, and behaviors of their tutees which is one of the most important traits that a tutor should possess.

“I’m looking for a tutor for my child who is industrious/hardworking and dedicated to tutoring children.” -P1

“Well trained teacher, have patience and consideration so the tutee can be at ease with her.” -P7

“Diligence because aside from having an extra income, the child also needs my diligence in teaching because of what their parents could not fulfill, so what I need is diligence” -TR3

“So, me as a teacher, having positive traits in my personality as being passionate, patient, cooperative and authoritative. I will be a successful teacher and I will get my pupils’ satisfaction.” -TR7

One of the qualities that parent-informants and tutor-informants is kind. A tutor who is kind to their tutee will make them happy and feel special. Parents believe how essential attitudes are, the tutor they desire to engage with their child should have a positive attitude, such as being kind, to provide their child with an excellent tutoring experience. A rigorous tutor encourages more cooperation and earnest preparation for the teachings from the tutees (Chester, 2019).

This was also supported by the recollection of the tutor-informants, they underscored that a tutor’s personality has a vast impact on the tutee. A worthy tutor is kind to his/her tutees, colleagues, parents, and others (Alrubail, 2015). Strict tutors may bring out the best in tutees by teaching them how to follow deadlines in a fun and effective way and not allowing poor behavior (Killeen, 2018). Tutor-informants also emphasized that being strict is also a need in tutoring, and showing authority when needed.

“The things that I consider when hiring a tutor for my child, I would like a tutor who is kind and has long patience, and knows how to relate well with people.” -P9

“Of course, the one who is kind, when the tutor has bad attitude and has not enough patience in tutoring, the child won’t learn well because of fear.” -P11

“In my experience as a tutor, when I am teaching them, they quickly answer all their assignments and easily understand their lesson and that’s because of our friendly relationship.

Whenever my students did something wrong, I don't yell at them, instead, I will say, "that is wrong".) -TR1

"A tutor's personality creates a huge impact on tutees, the reason why as a tutor, you must be kind and be a role model for them to have the eagerness to continue their studies." -TR2

A tutor should possess technical knowledge, according to an article, in order to feel secure in their skills and abilities. Technical knowledge can be summed up as someone's level of understanding of a subject or procedure. In order to help their tutees, become proficient and advance in a specific field of study or talent, tutors must possess a certain level of technical ability (Indeed Editorial Team, 2021).

"For many years that I've been teaching, I already gained confidence in how I teach and I also know how to get along with my tutees." -TR4

"I'm confident in my teaching ability because you can't stand in front if you're shy, and you can't clearly deliver your lesson." -TR10

"Confidence helps us feel ready for life experience in teaching you have to be prepared (sic), so if you are prepared you are ready and you are confident because you are prepared (sic)." -TR11

Teaching Strategies Used by the Tutors as Perceived by the Parents and Tutor-informants

This theme was developed in consistence with the problem statements. This theme dealt with the tutors' teaching strategies as seen through the eyes of the parents. After the analysis, six (6) meaningful sub-themes emerged: storytelling, question and answer, collaborative activities, demonstration, visualization strategies, and motivational activities. In accordance to the statements of the problem, this theme was formulated. This theme discusses the teaching strategies employed by the tutors when teaching their tutees. After the analysis, three (3) sub-themes emerged: motivational strategies, monitoring, and question and answer.

Both key-informants stated that tutors should also ask questions to help students uncover what they have learned, fully explore the topic at hand, encourage conversation, and socialize.

The parent-informants believe that the question-and-answer approach to instruction is effective. Moreover, they mentioned that when tutors ask questions, tutees can develop confidence by responding to the queries. The questioning method is efficient, according to study done at the University of Waterloo (2021) because it grabs students' attention, increases engagement, and makes it simpler to establish a positive, active learning environment.

Tutor-informants mentioned that asking questions is an efficient way to determine whether or not the tutee they were working with really understood the material. Tutor-informants observed that using this method can significantly benefit their tutees by raising their degree of critical thinking. Tofade, Elsner, and Haines (2013) state that questions are widely used to promote understanding, stimulate the retention of prior knowledge, and develop critical thinking abilities.

"Every time the tutor asks a question and my child is able to answer the question. The tutor asks so that the child will think, in that way I can see that my child is learning." -P11

"The tutor encourages my child to accomplish his activity, the tutor gives motivation, she's asking a question if my child can answer it then she'll give him a reward after he finishes his activity." -P13

"Questioning for developing their thinking skills, because here they come up with their ideas." -TR8

"My questioning technique is important because it is stimulating, actually questioning stimulates learning and develops the potential of learners to think." -TR11

Furthermore, a tutor is supposed to have the ability to ask and understand the subject matter being taught in teaching and learning activities. One of the most common goals of tutor questions is to spark an interest, and the curiosity of tutees about the subject being taught. Berghmans et al. (2013) highlighted those tutors used a variety of strategies, but they favored answering and guiding actions the most.

"Checked his score before. Review the last lesson then adds another lesson to the next tutoring session." -TR6

"I always assess his progress through activities and tests." -TR8

"I always assess his progress through activities and tests." -TR8

Parent-informants have revealed that they have always been able to observe the collaboration that takes place between the tutors and the students who are being taught. Cooperation with more knowledgeable others (MKOs), according to Mcleod (2019), remains extremely important because it enables students to learn about subjects in which they are deficient, which in turn leads to learning acquisition.

"Pair or group discussions, games." -P3

"Most of the time I see them playing, maybe that's the collaborative activities between my child and his tutor." -P5

"I can see them doing the activity together like the activity that is required to have a product output. Another collaborative activity is playing games." -P7

Undeniably, it was stated that other theorists began structuring Vygotsky's idea, known as the zone of proximal development (ZPD) in the classroom. ZPD focuses about what a student can accomplish on their own as opposed to what they can achieve with the help of others. ZPD may be represented as a set of three concentric circles. The smallest circle symbolizes the child's ability to study independently. The smaller circle denotes the abilities that a student can learn with the assistance of an educator. The biggest circle symbolizes abilities that the student currently lacks, even with assistance.

With that, parents perceive that their child's tutor is providing collaborative activities, which not only boosts their desire for learning but also encourages active learning (Cheng et al., 2021).

The tutee-informants mentioned that the relevance of tutoring on school performance strengthens their subject comprehension when the tutee receives a quality education from their tutor. The informants said that they can get extra knowledge about the topic that they encounter difficulties with. With their tutors, they can boost their confidence in terms of socializing with others, and improving work habits and self-confidence. Similarly, with the help of their tutors, they said that they improved their study habits and also improved their academic performance. Tutee-informants learn more during their tutoring sessions and get the quality education that they need.

Lastly, is that they encourage personal learning where they can do it with themselves and be more independent in every step they take. Guill et al., (2014) discovered that many students take private tutoring in addition to traditional schooling to boost their academic performance.

"Before my grades were low and now, they have become higher." -TTE 2

"She's guiding me on what I need to do and she's helping me with my assignments."-TTE3

"I can understand my lesson now and I can answer my assignments quickly."-TTE 5

"I can now answer my teacher's question inside the classroom then I tell it to my tutor she said I'm very good."-TTE 12

One of the teaching strategies used by the tutors as perceived by the parent-informants is storytelling. The use of storytelling in the classroom enables teachers to enter into the lives of students at a time when they are engaged on forming their own sense of identity (Bartelheim, 2016).

"Sometimes the tutor reads short stories to my child." -P2

"Reading is one of their routines after their teaching and learning sessions." -P8

"Mostly I'm seeing my child tutor. She's reading a story." - P15

Parent-informants who provided information believed that tutors used demonstrations as a teaching method. Before allowing the tutee performs the tasks or procedures on their own, they demonstrate them. Demonstrations, in accordance with Basheer, Hugerat, Kortam, and Hofstein (2016), can be a powerful tool for improving tutees' comprehension of specific topics as well as elevating tutees' motivation and interest in learning these concepts.

"She can explain to my child what he's going to do." -P2

"She ensures that she explains it properly to my child before giving it as an activity."-P3

"As much as possible she's guiding my child on how to finish the activity. If the tutor knows that my child is ready, then she gives my child an opportunity to answer the activity on his own. After that, she'll check if my child's answer is correct. If she sees the answer was wrong, she will reteach it until my child gets it." -P5

The tutors used the visualization strategy during the evaluation process in addition to teaching. Ulusoy (2019) discovered that students preferred the use of visual aids since it speeds up their understanding of the material. Parents who provided information believed that the visualization strategy helped the tutee learn. Visualization and conceptualization of three-dimensional things are difficult cognitive processes that necessitate the development of a tutee's spatial decoding and encoding abilities.

"Visual she remembers what they see. They prefer pictures, images, and others." -P3

"Incorporate images and charts into the study material." -P8

"Visual through picture." -P10

The tutees' parents witnessed that tutors are using motivation as another strategy throughout the tutoring sessions with their children. Active use of motivational strategies in the classroom can boost students' motivation for a predetermined period of time to meet the learning objectives they have set for themselves (Green, 2019).

"Every time he doesn't want to stop with other things, the tutor promises to give him a toy, and then he'll listen to the whole lesson" -P1

"Reward participation, make lessons relevant to life." -P3

"Every time they have an activity, the tutor gives a reward to get my child's attention."-P9

The instructional methods of informing and suggesting, the cognitive scaffolding strategy of pumping and

the motivational scaffolding strategy of exhibiting worry were shown to be the most commonly employed by tutors. The parent also said that it's help tutees focus better.

"Tutors give him a reward after finishing the given activity, sometimes it's candy or sometimes a star."-P10

"Well, is see to it that we review his lesson be before the exam and regularly check his score on his/her test." - TR5

"Most of the time I encourage them with praise and sometimes give rewards like candies to my tutees. But I think the effective is praise. If they know the right what they're doing that will motivate them."- TR8

Qualities of a Worthy Tutor as Perceived by the Parents and Tutor-Informants

In this theme, the qualities of a worthy tutor as perceived by the parents were distinguished. Parents' participation and involvement in choosing a worthy tutor for their children's academic success is significant. The qualities of a worthy tutor as perceived by the parents were described into six (6) sub-themes which include patient and flexible, good communication skills, knowledgeable, enthusiastic to work, has self-discipline, and knows how to teach. As viewed by tutor-informants, the theme was divided into five (5) sub-themes: having teaching experience, being patient, having strong communication skills, having a positive attitude, and being eager to work.

A tutor's patience and flexibility are both recognized by parents and tutors. Patience is the most prevalent characteristic that a tutor must possess. According to Indeed Editorial Team (2020), patience is a fundamental skill in tutoring because tutors have excellent understanding of a subject and need to assist the tutee who knows little to nothing about a particular subject. With this in line, parents also perceive that the flexibility of the tutor also matters. Tutor's ability to adjust has a strong impact on the learning of the tutee. Flexibility in tutoring is essential as tutors need to face the diverse learner abilities, demands, preferences, and necessitates (Netcom, 2013).

They can be good tutors since they are patient with tutees who have different viewpoints on learning. Some tutees are exceptionally sluggish in some topics, and others are merely ordinary. Patient tutors will almost certainly meet a wide range of tutees throughout the duration of their tutoring career. Each would have a unique background. Each will have various areas of strength and weakness. They will all have quite different expectations of their tutor (Pragya, 2019).

"Patience has a big effect on tutoring especially in teaching children because as a person whom a parent trusts, you must have the patience that the parents give to their child. The child

will not be open to you if you don't have patience, you won't get his trust."-P1

"The qualities I am looking for, just like what I've said, are flexibility and patience. Patience, if a tutor has long patience, he/she can achieve and impart his/her knowledge to the tutee, the tutoring will succeed if the tutor's patience is there." -P6

"One of these is having long patience in talking to the tutee."-TR9

Another quality of a worthy tutor that was perceived by the parent-informants and tutor-informants is having good communication skills. It proves that communication is one of the keys to effective learning. To educate the tutees in line with their capabilities and competence, a tutor must espouse communication skills that encourage students in their learning process (Bee, 2012)

To advance their careers in tutoring, tutors must also have excellent communication skills so that the tutee can learn more and easily understand the tutor's discussion. Tutors must be capable of understanding and analyzing complex messages, explaining them to students in a way that keeps their attention (both verbal and nonverbal), and listening to and addressing any questions or issues that might occur (Sword, 2020).

"Must have good communication skills for my child to learn more from the tutor."-P3

"I want a tutor that can communicate well with my child so she can teach the lesson that my child didn't understand at school."-P4

"Must be good at socializing with others to deliver the lesson well."-TR1

"I can adjust while communicating with them. I can be a kid."-TR10

According to the parent-informants and tutor-informants, one of the qualities that a tutor must possess to be a hired tutor is having self-discipline and having a good attitude. An essential facet that a tutor must portray is self-discipline. A tutor is a role model who is usually imitated by students, he or she should set a good example for them. Tutees imitate the actions and attitudes that tutors demonstrate both within and outside the classroom, allowing discipline to be imparted to students (Setyowati, 2019).

Tutor-informants said that recognizing a good attitude for a tutor may recommend them to others. Tutors mirror this trait in the tutees by their behaviors because teaching is a human-centered profession, as a result, tutees will be more receptive to understanding the world around them (Alrubail, 2015).

“A tutor should have rules for herself, I want a tutor who is self-disciplined so she can be a good role model to my child.” -P3

“Being disciplined is a way to be well-equipped, a tutor must be self-disciplined in all aspects.” -P14

“If you will be recognized with a good attitude you will ah be recommended by others if they can see your dedication.” -TR5

‘Has a good attitude that one for me, if she has the bad attitude the tutee doesn’t like even their parents want.’- TR11

It was added by the parent-informants and tutor-informants that the two qualities that parent-informants perceived in a worthy tutor are being knowledgeable and knowing how to teach. Tutoring requires subject matter expertise and an awareness of educational procedures in order to acquire the necessary understanding (Heggart, 2016).

A tutor’s knowledge build-up the skills, problem-solving, and reasoning of the tutee. Selecting a tutor for a child should be handled carefully. In order for the tutor to make the tutee learn, having knowledge about the subject matter is important (Chapman University, 2016).

With this in line, tutor-informants also claimed that for a tutor to be considered worthy, he/she must have experience in teaching. Tutors with teaching experience not only prompted tutees to indicate higher knowledge deficiencies, but also employed formative evaluation more frequently in response to those gaps than tutors without teaching experience (Herppich et al., 2014).

“I want a tutor who is knowledgeable enough to make my child learn.”-P11

“Must know all the subjects and of course, also knows the needs of the tutee.” -P14

“Of course, those who have experience in tutoring.”-TR3

“Those with experience in teaching and those with long patience.”- TR14

According to the key informants, one of the attributes that the tutor must have been enthusiasm for work and a willingness to work. Both parent-informants and tutor-informants mentioned that to become worth hiring tutors you must have the enthusiasm to work and a willingness to work. Tutors must be enthusiastic and motivated to teach more actively and effectively in order for them to share their knowledge with their tutees (Honggowibowo & Ayuningtyas, 2022). However, tutors as observed by parents observed the tutors’ enthusiasm to work that can affect the learning of the tutee.

A tutor's passion can result in higher teaching evaluations, better attitudes toward instructors, increased student

performance, and better classroom attitude (Zhang, 2014). Tutor-informants stated that willingness to work requires consistent work for the further improvement of the learning environment of the tutee.

“Dedication leads to success. A dedicated tutor is highly regarded. If the tutor has a dedication to her work, then her tutee can learn more.” -P7

“Diligent, the dedication and commitment of their work as a tutor shows that they are worthy of the job and that can be trusted and can be relied on.” -P12

“When your tutor is ready for everything, you know the all subjects your tutees need to teach their needs, that is why it is important.”-TR2

“A dedicated teacher not only having a passion for their job and loves to teach but also consistently works to make their learning environment a better place for all.” -TR7

The Synthesis of Interpretation

Upon the data that was gathered, parents stated the teaching strategies used by the tutors that they perceived and also the teaching strategies used by the tutors. These strategies are the use of storytelling, demonstration, question-and-answer, collaborative activities, monitoring activities, visualization strategies, and motivational strategies. In relation to the Scaffolding Theory, all of these strategies that were mentioned fall under the Metacognitive Scaffolding because the tutor-informants plan how to achieve their goal and establish effective learning strategies for the tutees, they continue to monitor the progress the by using question-and-answer and monitoring activities, and lastly, they evaluate based on the results of the monitoring process. Based on the narratives of the tutee-informants, it was proven that the said teaching strategies were effective. Tutors must be aware of the teaching strategies they use and also modify them based on the needs and level of the tutee. The said strategies can be of great help to the other tutors as they plan to support the tutee’s learning development. This study brings an understanding to elementary education on how the strategies that are used by the Tutor-informants are effective to the tutees. This would give them insights into the perspective of the other parents and tutors that served as the key informants of the study and could make them aware of the benefits of tutoring to the tutees and the teaching strategies that tutor-informants used in tutoring.

6. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

6.1 Summary of Findings

Based on the discussion of the study, the following significant findings were as follows:

1. When parents hire a tutor for their child, they tend to know what the educational attainment that the tutor has. They want to ensure the quality that the tutor gives to the tutee. In teaching different subjects, parents stated the importance of the tutor's mastery of different subjects. Some parent-informants also added that if a tutor is not knowledgeable about the subjects, it would be difficult for the tutor to impart lessons that the tutee needs. Being patient and diligent on the part of tutors is what the parent-informants want their tutors to be. Interacting with a tutee also requires having good communication skills which is another qualification that parent-informants find in hiring tutors. Parent-informants also perceive the importance of flexibility of the tutor that can be used in teaching the lesson. Lastly, parent-informants want their child to be administered by kind tutors who have passion and love for their professions.

2. As experienced by the tutor-informants, they can communicate well which led them to express themselves easily and share their thoughts and ideas to gain understanding. Participants also perceive that their self-confidence and having knowledge of different subjects help them provide for the needs of their tutees. The tutor-informants stated that they are flexible in what they are doing. They extend and sometimes schedule their time when there are activities. Another attribute of tutor-informants as indicated was strictness and kindness which their personality is inclined to.

3. Strategies used by tutor-informants that are perceived by parents are more likely to be storytelling that produces a great impact on the tutee's narrative activities, question and answer, collaborative activities, demonstration, visualization, and motivational strategies.

4. Tutor-informants stated the strategies used in tutoring which can be an effective tool to teach tutees in an enjoyable way. Based on the information gathered, we have come up to (3) sub-themes which are the; motivational strategies, monitoring strategies, and question and answer.

5. Parent-informants mentioned that the qualities of a worthy tutor are patience, flexibility, good communication skills, knowledgeable, enthusiastic, has self-discipline, and is good in teaching.

6. In teaching the tutees, tutor-informants stated that there are qualifications to be qualified as being tutor, first is teaching experience, and next are the characteristics of patience, good communicator, good attitude, and willingness to work.

7. When it comes to school performance, the tutees were helped to strengthen the following: subject comprehension, boost confidence, improve study habits, improve academic performance, and encourage personalized learning.

6.2 Conclusions

Based on the problem statements, the following conclusions were drawn:

1. The parent-informants had similar responses when asked about the characteristics they are seeking in a tutor, and these are: must be a college graduate, knowledgeable in all subjects, patient and diligent, has good communication skills, flexible, and kind. Parent-informants confidently anticipate that their child will learn from the tutor if he/she possesses the aforementioned characteristics.

2. All tutor-informants specified that in order to be a tutor, they must possess have good communication skills, self-confidence, knowledgeable in all subjects, flexible, strict, kind, and lastly, patient. These characteristics help them capture the hearts and minds of their tutees especially in helping the tutees reach their goal.

3. All parent-informants stated that they observed the strategies of storytelling, question and answer, collaborative activities, demonstration, visualization strategies, and motivational strategies that mainly helped the tutors as they teach their tutees to better understand the lesson.

4. Tutor-informants mentioned that they use motivational strategies, activity-monitoring, and question and answer method. The said strategies were used by the tutors to help the tutees progress and improve holistically. They added that some strategies were helpful academically while some gave a friendly-attachment to their tutees.

5. Parent-informants answered that a tutor is worth hiring if he/she is patient, flexible, has good communication skills, is knowledgeable, is enthusiastic to work, has self-confidence, and knows how to teach.

6. The tutors are aware that to be worth hiring, they must possess the following: teaching experience, patience, good communication skills, a good attitude, and willingness to work.

7. When it comes to school performance, the tutee-informants mentioned that tutoring strengthened their subject comprehension, boosted their confidence, improved their study habits and academic performance, and encouraged them to learn more independently.

6.3 Recommendations

Based on the findings of the study and the conclusions mentioned above, the researchers offer the following recommendations:

1. Parents may recommend tutors with these attributes: college graduates, knowledgeable about all the subjects,

patient and diligent, good communicator, flexible, and lastly, kind.

2. Tutors must first examine their skills if they are qualified for this type of profession. Some people merely go into tutoring which leads to ineffective tutoring.

3. Parents can examine their child before tutoring in which strategies can be helpful and effective to their child. Some strategies can be suggested to the tutor to give more emphasis on that strategy so that the tutor can easily adjust.

4. Tutors must provide additional strategies that fit their tutees' abilities and strengths to further utilize the chosen strategies to be effective. They should also look into the individual differences of children when looking for the best strategies when tutoring.

5. Parents should consider screening the tutor before availing his/her service. If the qualities of the tutor satisfied the parents' standards, then the parent can consider hiring the said tutor.

6. Tutors must enhance their given skills to maintain their quality as a tutor. They should also enroll in graduate school particularly in courses such as Teaching in Early Grades, Early Childhood Education, or Special Education to become more effective and efficient in their field.

7. Highly-regarded tutors due to excellent performance must be recommended by parents to their friends and colleagues. This is a good way of helping them back as they were able to help their children to excel in school.

8. Researchers who undertake the same study in the future can use this as a guide. Using the information, they may be able to give a better understanding of the worth of hiring a tutor.

7. REFERENCES

- [1] Akimenko, O. (2017). Investigating the Effectiveness of Private Small Group Tutoring of English in Kazakhstan: Perceptions of Tutors and Students. *NUGSE Research in Education*, 2(1), 16-26. Retrieved from nugserie.nu.edu.kz
https://www.researchgate.net/publication/323473983_Investigating_the_Effectiveness_of_Private_Small_Group_Tutoring_of_English_in_Kazakhstan_Perceptions_of_Tutors_and_Students
- [2] Alrubail, R. (2015). *The Heart of Teaching: What It Means to Be a Great Teacher*. Edutopia; George Lucas Educational Foundation. <https://www.edutopia.org/discussion/heart-teaching-what-it-means-be-great-teacher>
- [3] Altrichter H, Posch O, Somekh B. (1996) *Teachers Investigate their work: an introduction to the methods of action research*. Routledge, London
<https://www.taylorfrancis.com/books/mono/10.4324/9780203978979/teachers-investigate-work-herbert-altrichter-allan-feldman-peter-posch-bridget-somekh>
- [4] Bartelheim, E. (2016). *Storytelling in the classroom*. Ohio University.
<https://www.ohio.edu/instructionalinnovation/stories/showcase/storytellingclassroom:%7E:text=Storytelling%20as%20a%20Teaching%20Strategy,trust%2C%20and%20sense%20of%20connection>
- [5] Bee, S (2012) *The Impact of Teachers' Communication Skills on Teaching: Reflections of Pre- service Teachers on their Communication Strengths and Weaknesses*. ISSN 1755-9715
<http://old.hltmag.co.uk/feb12/mart.htm?fbclid=IwAR16fQrF4uUVVeqW1BSrEEQ2h-z7ymekqKaIu2gCZ9h0IWjhL1MhoyExHgA>
- [6] Benckwitz, L., Guill, K., Roloff, J., Ömeroğulları, M., & Köller, O. (2022). Investigating the relationship between private tutoring, tutors' use of an individual frame of reference, reasons for private tutoring, and students' motivational-affective outcomes. <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1041608022000243>
- [7] Berghmans, I., Neckebroek, F., Dochy, F. et al. A typology of approaches to peer tutoring. *Unraveling peer tutors' behavioural strategies*. *Eur J Psychol Educ* 28, 703–723 (2013).
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s10212-012-0136-3>
- [8] Bhandari, P. (2022). *Triangulation in Research | Guide, Types, Examples*
<https://www.scribbr.com/methodology/triangulation/>
- [9] Bhandari, P. (2022). *What is Qualitative Research? | Methods & Examples*
<https://www.scribbr.com/methodology/qualitative-research/>
- [10] Bonds, Calvin, "Best storytelling practices in education"(2016). *Theses and Dissertations*. 693.
<https://digitalcommons.pepperdine.edu/etd/693>
- [11] Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2012). Thematic analysis. In H. Cooper, P. M. Camic, D. L. Long, A. T. Panter, D. Rindskopf, & K. J. Sher (Eds.), *APA handbook of research methods in psychology*, Vol. 2. *Research designs: Quantitative, qualitative, neuropsychological, and biological* (pp. 57–71). American Psychological Association. <https://doi.org/10.1037/13620-004>

- [12] Braun, V. & Clarke, V. (2019) Reflecting on reflexive thematic analysis, *Qualitative Research in Sport, Exercise and Health*, 11:4, 589-597. DOI: 10.1080/2159676X.2019.1628806
- [13] Byun, S. Y., Chung, H. J., & Baker, D. P. (2018). Global patterns of the use of shadow education: Student, family, and national influences. In *Research in the Sociology of Education* (pp. 71-105). (Research in the Sociology of Education; Vol. 20). Emerald Group Publishing Ltd.. <https://doi.org/10.1108/S1479-353920180000020004> <https://pennstate.pure.elsevier.com/en/publications/global-patterns-of-the-use-of-shadow-education-student-family-and>
- [14] Carr, W., Kemmis, S., Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison, K. R. B. (1986). *Becoming critical* (Lewes, Falmer). *Research Methods in Education*. https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=cohen+%26+manion&hl=en&as_sdt=0%2C5&scioq=+cohen+and+manion+1986&as_ylo=1986&as_yhi=1986
- [15] Chapman University (2016). What is Tutoring and What Tutoring is Not. <https://blogs.chapman.edu/scst/2016/02/09/what-tutoring-is-and-what-tutoring-is-not/>
- [16] Cheng, F., & Wu C.S., & Su, P. (2021). The Impact of Collaborative Learning and Personality on Satisfaction in Immovative Teaching Context. <https://doi.org/OI:10.3389/fpsyg.2021.713497>
- [17] Chester, D. (2019). Should a Teacher Be Strict or Friendly with Students? <https://www.skillsyouneed.com/rhubarb/teacher-strict-friendly.html>
- [18] Choi, Y., & Park, H. (2016). Shadow education and educational inequality in South Korea: Examining effect heterogeneity of shadow education on middle school seniors' achievement test scores. <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/abs/pii/S0276562416300026>
- [19] Chui, M. M. (2016, September 9). Perception of supplementary Tutorial studies by teachers in Public Secondary Schools in Kenya: case of Kiambu County. *International Journal of Education and Research*. Retrieved May 3, 2022, from <https://www.ijern.com/journal/2016/September-2016/22.pdf>
- [20] Country Note & OECD. (2018) Programme for international student assessment (PISA) Results form PISA 2018 https://www.oecd.org/pisa/publications/PISA2018_CN_PHL.pdf?fbclid=IwAR2ZyPO2KTJalij8O1dM0Z5nPqrQ_7oAEfqk9JeajWua3VhuXHdxSgk4mOc
- [21] Crossman, A. (2020). Understanding Purposive Sampling. An Overview of the Methods and Its Applications. - References. Scientific Research Publishing. Retrieved May 3, 2022, from <https://www.scirp.org/%28S%28lz5mqp453edsnp55rrgjct55%29%29/reference/referencespapers.aspx?referenceid=2967481>
- [22] Denzin, K. (1970) The research act in sociology: a theoretical introduction to sociological methods https://openlibrary.org/books/OL4861225M/The_research_act_in_sociology
- [23] Finley, T. (2017). Making sure your praise is effective. *Edutopia*. <https://www.edutopia.org/article/making-sure-your-praise-effective>
- [24] George, T. (2022). Semi-Structured Interview | Definition, Guide & Examples <https://www.scribbr.com/methodology/semi-structured-interview/>
- [25] Grey, D., & Osborne, C. (2018). Perceptions and principles of personal tutoring. *Journal of Further and Higher Education*. <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/0309877X.2018.1536258>
- [26] Guill, K., Ömeroğulları, M., & Köller, O. (2021). Intensity and content of private tutoring lessons during German secondary schooling: effects on students' grades and test achievements <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s10212-021-00581-x>
- [27] Guill, Karin; Bos, Wilfried: Effectiveness of private tutoring in mathematics with regard to subjective and objective indicators of academic achievement. Evidence from a German secondary school sample - In: *Journal for educational research online* 6 (2014) 1, S. 34-67 - URN: urn:nbn:de:0111-opus-88400 - DOI: 10.25656/01:8840 https://www.pedocs.de/frontdoor.php?source_opus=8840
- [28] Green, A. (2019). Motivation strategies for the classroom practitioner. Institute of Teacher Aide Courses. https://www.itac.edu.au/blog/teaching-strategies/motivationstrategies?fbclid=IwAR2AeVsmJnZHWcQmZkezHfEEOIDgAbNCrIt2Srd_VQSsWGWA X2rf0zfhf0M
- [29] Haider, M & Yasmin, A (2015). Significance of Scaffolding and peer Tutoring in the Light of Vygotsky's Theory of Zone of Proximal Development. *International*

- Journal of Languages, Literature and Linguistics, 1 (3) <http://www.ijlll.org/vol1/33-L310.pdf>
- [30] Hajar, A. (2018). Exploring Year 6 pupils' perceptions of private tutoring: evidence from three mainstream schools in England. <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/03054985.2018.1430563?journalCode=core20>
- [31] Heggart, K. (2016). How Important is Subject Matter Knowledge for a Teacher? <https://www.edutopia.org/discussion/how-important-subject-matter-knowledge-teacher>
- [32] Herppich, Stephanie & Wittwer, Jörg & Nückles, Matthias & Renkl, Alexander. (2014). Addressing Knowledge Deficits in Tutoring and the Role of Teaching Experience: Benefits for Learning and Summative Assessment. *Journal of Educational Psychology*. 106. 934-945. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/277684993_Addresssing_Knowledge_Deficits_in_Tutoring_and_the_Role_of_Teaching_Experience_Benefits_for_Learning_and_Summative_Assessment
- [33] Honggowibowo, A. & Ayuningtyas, A. (2022). Determination of Tutor Rewards Using the Profile Matching Method <https://zenodo.org/record/6791784#.YtmHf3ZBzIV>
- [34] How to be a good tutor for kids & teens. (2020, June 9). iD Tech. <https://www.idtech.com/blog/traits-and-characteristics-of-a-great-tutor>
- [35] Basheer, A., Hugerat, M., Kortam, N., & Hofstein, A. (2016). The effectiveness of teachers' use of demonstrations for enhancing students' understanding of and attitudes to learning the Oxidation-Reduction concept. *EURASIA Journal of Mathematics, Science and Technology Education*, 13(3). <https://doi.org/10.12973/eurasia.2017.00632a><https://doi.org/10.12973/eurasia.2017.00632a>
- [36] Indeed Editorial Team. (2020). How to become a tutor. Indeed Career Guide. <https://www.indeed.com/career-advice/career-development/what-does-a-tutor-do>
- [37] Indeed Editorial Team. (2021). 10 Must-Have tutoring skills. Indeed Career Guide. <https://www.indeed.com/career-advice/career-development/tutoring-skills>
- [38] Indeed Editorial Team (2021). Vygotsky Scaffolding: What It Is and How To Use It <https://www.indeed.com/career-advice/career-development/vygotsky-scaffolding#:~:text=Vygotsky%20scaffolding%20is%20a%20theory,to%20process%20on%20their%20own.>
- [39] Iversen, S., & Subedi, K. R. (2018). Shadow Education: A Role of Private Tutoring in Learning. ERIC. Retrieved May 4, 2022, from <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED591992.pdf>
- [40] Killeen, M. (2018). Is it Better to Have a Strict Teacher or A Fun Teacher? Strict, Believe it or Not <https://studentedge.org/article/is-it-better-to-have-a-strict-teacher-or-a-fun-teacher-strict-believe-it-or-not>
- [41] Liden, S. (2013). What makes a successful tutor? <https://www.edutopia.org/blog/what-makes-a-successful-tutor-seth-linden> <https://talentnook.com/blog/the-5-most-important-qualities-of-an-effective-tutor> <https://psycnet.apa.org/buy/2014-08128-001>
- [42] Mcleod, S. (2019, March 24). The zone of proximal development and scaffolding. Simply Psychology. <https://www.simplypsychology.org/Zone-of-Proximal-Development.html>
- [43] Mendoza, A. (2019). <https://www.pressreader.com/philippines/sunstarpampangana/20190717/281698321326690>
- [44] Mwebi, R. (2016). Perceptions of Parents on the Practice of Private Tuition in Public Learning Institution in Kenya Monitoring. (2021). British Council <https://www.teachingenglish.org.uk/article/monitoringhtps://www.teachingenglish.org.uk/article/monitoring>
- [45] Naeem S. (2019). Data Triangulation in Qualitative Research <http://researcharticles.com/index.php/data-triangulation-in-qualitative-research/>
- [46] Netcom 29 (2013) The Importance of a Flexible Teaching Approach <https://www.netcom92.com/2013/07/importance-flexible-teaching-approach>
- [47] Nickow, A., Oreopoulos, P., & Quan, V. (2020). The Impressive Effects of Tutoring on PreK-12 Learning A Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analysis of the Experimental Evidence <https://www.nber.org/papers/w27476>
- [48] Ömeroğulları M., Guill K. & Köller O. (2020) Effectiveness of private tutoring during secondary schooling in Germany: Do the duration of private tutoring and tutor qualification affect school achievement? https://www.researchgate.net/publication/339201609_Effectiveness_of_private_tutoring_during_secondary_sch

- ooling_in_Germany_Do_the_duration_of_private_tutoring_and_tutor_qualification_affect_school_achievement
- [49] Otto, B., & Karbach, J. (2019). The effects of the private tutoring on students' perception of the parents' academic involvement and the quality of their parent-child relationships https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/01443410.2019.1610725?journalCode=ce_dp20
- [50] Park, H., Buchmann, C., Choi., & Merry J. (2016). Learning Beyond the School Walls: Trends and Implications <https://www.annualreviews.org/doi/abs/10.1146/annurev-soc-081715-074341>
- [51] Pragma (2019). The 5 most important qualities of an effective tutor. <https://talentnook.com/blog/the-5-most-important-qualities-of-an-effective-tutorhttps://talentnook.com/blog/the-5-most-important-qualities-of-an-effective-tutor>
- [52] Question strategies. (2021, November 23). University of Waterloo. <https://uwaterloo.ca/centre-for-teaching-excellence/teaching-resources/teaching-tips/alternatives-lecturing/questions/question-strategies>
- [53] Setyowati, E. (2019). The Application on Teacher Discipline to Improve Teacher Performance; a Review <https://eudl.eu/pdf/10.4108/eai.20-8-2019.2288101>
- [54] South Central College. (2019). What is tutoring? https://southcentral.edu/tutor_training/module1/index.html
- [55] Stastny, V., & Walterova, E. (2019). The Influence of School on Private Tutoring Usage https://www.researchgate.net/publication/341610939_The_influence_of_school_on_private_tutoring_usage
- [56] Surbhi, S. (2017). Difference Between Exploratory and Descriptive Research <https://keydifferences.com/difference-between-exploratory-and-descriptive-research.html>
- [57] Sword, R. (2020). Effective Communication in the Classroom: Skills for Teachers <https://www.highspeedtraining.co.uk/hub/communication-skills-for-teachers/>
- [58] Tofade, T., Elsner, J., & Haines, S. (2013). Best Practice Strategies for Effective Use of Questions as a Teaching Tool. American Journal of Pharmaceutical Education https://www.researchgate.net/publication/256837974_Best_Practice_Strategies_forEffective_Use_of_Questions_as_a_Teaching_Tool?fbclid=IwAR3XQbdHVyEYKz_pV2xkXI-aynBjT8C1winhL_niaZIZRGp_tZIZ4yvX-go
- [59] Tutor2u. (2020, December 8). Maturation Theory (Gesell) | Topics. Tutor2u. <https://www.tutor2u.net/hsc/topics/gesells-maturation-theory#:~:text=Gesell>
- [60] Tutoring for Excellence (2014). 4 Essential Things to Look For in a Tutor <https://www.tutoringforexcellence.com.au/blog/what-makes-a-good-tutor/#:~:text=Patience%20is%20a%20virtue&text=Tutors%20must%20be%20patient%20with,skill%20of%20a%20successful%20tutor.>
- [61] Ulusoy, E. (2019). Importance of visuals in class discussions | faculty resource network. Faculty Resource Network. <https://facultyresourcenetwork.org/publications/critical-conversations-and-the-academy/importance-of-visuals-in-class-discussions/>
- [62] UNESCO. (2020). Education: From disruption to recovery. UNESCO. <https://en.unesco.org/covid19/educationresponseViews>. Iranian Journal of Comparative Education, 2(1), 41-64. Retrieved May 3, 2022, from https://journal.cesir.ir/article_94150.html
- [63] Walczak, K. (2015). Ten characteristics of an effective tutor. Sac.Edu. <https://www.sac.edu/AcademicProgs/ScienceMathHealth/MathCenter/PDF/Tutor%20Training/Module%203/10%20Characteristics%20of%20a%20Good%20Tutor.pdf>
- [64] Wyzant. (2022). What Types of Qualifications Should I Look for in a Tutor? - Wyzant Blog. Retrieved September 16, 2022, from <https://www.wyzant.com/blog/what-type-of-qualifications-should-i-look-for-in-a-tutor/?fbclid=IwAR3fHGvH97zltgoqOdII9zguFpsL0Orje9j3YrSRx1LofsORhsWR7z6k43o>
- [65] Yaman, B. (2019). A Multiple Case Study: What Happens in Peer Tutoring of Calculus Studies? International Journal of Education in Mathematics Science and Technology, 7(1), <https://doi.org/10.18404/ijemst.328336> <http://acikerisim.mu.edu.tr/xmlui/handle/20.500.12809/1244>
- [66] Zlatovic, A. (2018). Benefits of Communication on the Learning Process <https://nobeexplorers.com/benefits-communication-learning-process/>
- [67] Zhang, Q. (2014). Instructor's Corner #3: Teaching with Enthusiasm: Engaging Students, Sparking Curiosity, and Jumpstarting Motivation <https://www.natcom.org/communication-currents/instructors-corner-3-teaching-enthusiasm-engaging-students-sparking-curiosity>

- [68] Zhang, W., Bray, M. (2016). Shadow Education. In: Guo, S., Guo, Y. (eds) Spotlight on China. Spotlight on China. SensePublishers, Rotterdam. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-6209-881-7_6